

**BERNARDO
KASTRUP**

**SUSAN
BLACKMORE**

**ILLUSIONISM
VS. IDEALISM**



1
00:00:04,490 --> 00:00:02,450
Consciousness is not there Consciousness

2
00:00:06,889 --> 00:00:04,500
is not a personal self it's not a soul

3
00:00:09,770 --> 00:00:06,899
it's phenomenal States it has a a

4
00:00:13,850 --> 00:00:09,780
precise definition by totally and

5
00:00:19,130 --> 00:00:16,849
all right this is one highly anticipated

6
00:00:21,890 --> 00:00:19,140
episode today we have a theolocution

7
00:00:23,929 --> 00:00:21,900
with Susan Blackmore and Bernardo Castro

8
00:00:25,790 --> 00:00:23,939
well what is a theologution it's a

9
00:00:27,650 --> 00:00:25,800
conversation between two people who are

10
00:00:30,410 --> 00:00:27,660
trying to understand one another's views

11
00:00:32,269 --> 00:00:30,420
and even constructively that is add to

12
00:00:34,430 --> 00:00:32,279
the so-called opponent's views in real

13
00:00:37,010 --> 00:00:34,440

time rather than destructively

14

00:00:39,350 --> 00:00:37,020

criticizing with snark and even prepared

15

00:00:41,450 --> 00:00:39,360

lines which is what unfortunately tends

16

00:00:43,790 --> 00:00:41,460

to characterize most Clashing of ideas

17

00:00:45,830 --> 00:00:43,800

so you can think of a theologution as a

18

00:00:47,810 --> 00:00:45,840

Socratic dialogue that's moderated with

19

00:00:50,630 --> 00:00:47,820

regard appreciation and fondness

20

00:00:53,209 --> 00:00:50,640

Bernardo Castro is a leading voice in

21

00:00:54,950 --> 00:00:53,219

the field of philosophy of mind he's

22

00:00:57,830 --> 00:00:54,960

also a strong advocate of what's called

23

00:01:00,350 --> 00:00:57,840

analytic idealism Bernardo argues that

24

00:01:01,970 --> 00:01:00,360

Consciousness is fundamental in nature a

25

00:01:03,590 --> 00:01:01,980

Viewpoint which is articulated in this

26

00:01:06,830 --> 00:01:03,600

probative works including why

27

00:01:08,810 --> 00:01:06,840

materialism is baloney and the idea of

28

00:01:09,890 --> 00:01:08,820

the world links to both books are in the

29

00:01:11,750 --> 00:01:09,900

description as well as links to

30

00:01:13,789 --> 00:01:11,760

everything as usual because of the

31

00:01:15,770 --> 00:01:13,799

contrasting views in my opinion this epi

32

00:01:17,990 --> 00:01:15,780

episode serves as the best at least the

33

00:01:20,210 --> 00:01:18,000

one that I've seen the best introduction

34

00:01:21,950 --> 00:01:20,220

to bernardo's ideas although this is

35

00:01:23,810 --> 00:01:21,960

only the case when one already has an

36

00:01:25,670 --> 00:01:23,820

overview of some of the theories of

37

00:01:27,830 --> 00:01:25,680

Consciousness that exist else you'll

38

00:01:30,109 --> 00:01:27,840

just be weltering and swimming now Susan

39

00:01:32,030 --> 00:01:30,119

Blackmore is a visiting professor at the

40

00:01:33,770 --> 00:01:32,040

University of Plymouth who's carved out

41

00:01:36,710 --> 00:01:33,780

a career in the study of Consciousness

42

00:01:38,749 --> 00:01:36,720

memes and evolutionary biology becoming

43

00:01:40,910 --> 00:01:38,759

one of the most influential voices in

44

00:01:43,910 --> 00:01:40,920

these domains Susan is widely recognized

45

00:01:45,770 --> 00:01:43,920

for her seminal work the meme machine in

46

00:01:47,510 --> 00:01:45,780

fact years ago I read that and that's

47

00:01:48,830 --> 00:01:47,520

how I was introduced to her work again

48

00:01:50,630 --> 00:01:48,840

links to everything that's mentioned

49

00:01:52,550 --> 00:01:50,640

will be in the description pertinent to

50

00:01:54,770 --> 00:01:52,560

today's discussion Susan's an avid

51
00:01:56,630 --> 00:01:54,780
proponent of illusionism which is more

52
00:01:58,429 --> 00:01:56,640
nuanced than simply positing that

53
00:02:00,410 --> 00:01:58,439
Consciousness is nothing more than some

54
00:02:02,990 --> 00:02:00,420
Grand Illusion we talk about that and

55
00:02:04,730 --> 00:02:03,000
she dispels this myth my name is Kurt

56
00:02:06,289 --> 00:02:04,740
chemungal and I have this podcast here

57
00:02:08,270 --> 00:02:06,299
called theories of everything where I

58
00:02:10,609 --> 00:02:08,280
use my background in math and physics to

59
00:02:12,290 --> 00:02:10,619
analyze toes from a theoretical physics

60
00:02:13,729 --> 00:02:12,300
perspective predominantly though I'm

61
00:02:16,070 --> 00:02:13,739
also interested in other approaches as

62
00:02:17,750 --> 00:02:16,080
to what is fundamental what's considered

63
00:02:19,309 --> 00:02:17,760

fundamental is there holism and

64

00:02:20,690 --> 00:02:19,319

reductionism is incorrect how about

65

00:02:22,369 --> 00:02:20,700

Consciousness and where does that come

66

00:02:23,869 --> 00:02:22,379

into play you can think of it as the

67

00:02:25,369 --> 00:02:23,879

largest Mysteries of the universe

68

00:02:27,170 --> 00:02:25,379

without already having a defined

69

00:02:29,089 --> 00:02:27,180

position that I'm advocating for or

70

00:02:31,250 --> 00:02:29,099

trying to in a contrived way steer the

71

00:02:32,809 --> 00:02:31,260

conversation toward at around 20 to the

72

00:02:35,570 --> 00:02:32,819

30 minute Mark or so there'll be a

73

00:02:37,850 --> 00:02:35,580

couple of ads this video is sponsored by

74

00:02:40,130 --> 00:02:37,860

raid Shadow Legends alright now let's

75

00:02:41,869 --> 00:02:40,140

picture this you got yourself a phone a

76

00:02:44,210 --> 00:02:41,879

new phone and you're looking for an

77

00:02:47,030 --> 00:02:44,220

adventurous mobile game to play Enter

78

00:02:49,369 --> 00:02:47,040

raid Shadow Legends with its fantastic

79

00:02:52,309 --> 00:02:49,379

visuals a menagerie of powerful

80

00:02:55,130 --> 00:02:52,319

Champions challenging PVE bosses and

81

00:02:58,009 --> 00:02:55,140

tactical PVP content many of you may

82

00:02:59,809 --> 00:02:58,019

know I love video games so let me tell

83

00:03:02,330 --> 00:02:59,819

you about the three most interesting

84

00:03:05,210 --> 00:03:02,340

aspects of raid Shadow Legends in my

85

00:03:07,550 --> 00:03:05,220

opinion firstly raid call of the Arbiter

86

00:03:10,190 --> 00:03:07,560

is in full swing introducing new

87

00:03:12,350 --> 00:03:10,200

characters like artak the orc Lord log

88

00:03:15,110 --> 00:03:12,360

into raid for seven days before July

89

00:03:17,030 --> 00:03:15,120

24th to get art back for free if you

90

00:03:19,430 --> 00:03:17,040

haven't watched call of the Arbiter give

91

00:03:21,830 --> 00:03:19,440

it a shot secondly rage Shadow Legends

92

00:03:23,869 --> 00:03:21,840

visuals are breathtaking especially for

93

00:03:25,850 --> 00:03:23,879

a mobile game with intricate scenes and

94

00:03:28,070 --> 00:03:25,860

character designs immersing you in this

95

00:03:30,649 --> 00:03:28,080

fantastic World thirdly raid's variety

96

00:03:33,050 --> 00:03:30,659

of Champions and unique abilities offer

97

00:03:35,089 --> 00:03:33,060

numerous strategic options for instance

98

00:03:37,670 --> 00:03:35,099

the character Roy excels in Boss

99

00:03:40,430 --> 00:03:37,680

fighting so new players if you haven't

100

00:03:42,830 --> 00:03:40,440

started playing yet I urge you to also

101
00:03:45,050 --> 00:03:42,840
enjoy this gameplay use my link which is

102
00:03:46,610 --> 00:03:45,060
on screen now as well as the QR code you

103
00:03:49,309 --> 00:03:46,620
can scan that and you'll get a free

104
00:03:51,289 --> 00:03:49,319
starter pack with tremendous in-game

105
00:03:53,030 --> 00:03:51,299
loot just hit the toe Link in the

106
00:03:55,130 --> 00:03:53,040
description and I'll see you on the

107
00:03:57,350 --> 00:03:55,140
battlefield those drastically help

108
00:03:59,210 --> 00:03:57,360
support toe as well as the patrons and

109
00:04:01,690 --> 00:03:59,220
if you'd like to support toe yourself

110
00:04:04,930 --> 00:04:01,700
then visit [patreon.com](https://www.patreon.com)

111
00:04:08,990 --> 00:04:06,649
c-u-r-t-j-a-i-m-u-n-g-a-l as a donation

112
00:04:11,149 --> 00:04:09,000
with whatever you like genuinely helps

113
00:04:12,589 --> 00:04:11,159

it helps not only financially it helps

114

00:04:13,610 --> 00:04:12,599

emotionally to know that there are

115

00:04:15,649 --> 00:04:13,620

people out there like yourself who

116

00:04:18,349 --> 00:04:15,659

support to bring this to everyone at

117

00:04:20,030 --> 00:04:18,359

zero cost like that's fantastic so thank

118

00:04:21,949 --> 00:04:20,040

you to the patrons another podcast

119

00:04:24,350 --> 00:04:21,959

that's coming up is a Theo location with

120

00:04:25,909 --> 00:04:24,360

Bernardo Castro and David Papineau I

121

00:04:27,230 --> 00:04:25,919

hope I'm pronouncing that correctly you

122

00:04:29,330 --> 00:04:27,240

can look up they've had a conversation

123

00:04:30,590 --> 00:04:29,340

before on YouTube so watch that and if

124

00:04:32,150 --> 00:04:30,600

you feel like there was plenty that was

125

00:04:33,950 --> 00:04:32,160

left out of that then feel free to

126
00:04:35,749 --> 00:04:33,960
comment here and I'll ask those

127
00:04:37,969 --> 00:04:35,759
questions to Bernardo and to David

128
00:04:40,129 --> 00:04:37,979
bernardo's appeared several times on the

129
00:04:42,469 --> 00:04:40,139
theories of everything channel one solo

130
00:04:44,090 --> 00:04:42,479
Behemoth four hour episode that is

131
00:04:45,710 --> 00:04:44,100
actually one of the top episodes on

132
00:04:47,570 --> 00:04:45,720
theories of everything another one with

133
00:04:49,310 --> 00:04:47,580
John vervakie in fact there are two

134
00:04:51,170 --> 00:04:49,320
parts to that conversation definitely

135
00:04:53,210 --> 00:04:51,180
don't miss the second one as you can see

136
00:04:55,430 --> 00:04:53,220
a convergence of their ideas another one

137
00:04:57,350 --> 00:04:55,440
with Christopher Langan another one with

138
00:04:59,390 --> 00:04:57,360

Donald Hoffman as well as Susan

139

00:05:01,730 --> 00:04:59,400

Schneider and another one with Sabine

140

00:05:03,530 --> 00:05:01,740

hassenfelder on super determinism this

141

00:05:06,249 --> 00:05:03,540

is Susan's First and definitely not the

142

00:05:09,050 --> 00:05:06,259

last time on this channel enjoy welcome

143

00:05:11,030 --> 00:05:09,060

Sue Susan Blackmore welcome Bernardo

144

00:05:12,110 --> 00:05:11,040

Castro again it's a privilege to be here

145

00:05:14,270 --> 00:05:12,120

with you all

146

00:05:17,689 --> 00:05:14,280

good to see you both again

147

00:05:19,550 --> 00:05:17,699

hello first time for me

148

00:05:20,870 --> 00:05:19,560

sue you may not know this but I've

149

00:05:23,090 --> 00:05:20,880

wanted to speak to you for years

150

00:05:25,550 --> 00:05:23,100

primarily on memes because I read your

151

00:05:27,469 --> 00:05:25,560

book on memes the first question is that

152

00:05:29,870 --> 00:05:27,479

I'm sure people misconstrue what

153

00:05:31,249 --> 00:05:29,880

illusionism is so do you mind rectifying

154

00:05:32,510 --> 00:05:31,259

that so that we all have a shared

155

00:05:34,790 --> 00:05:32,520

understanding as to what your

156

00:05:37,730 --> 00:05:34,800

understanding of illusionism is

157

00:05:39,170 --> 00:05:37,740

right well illusionism roughly speaking

158

00:05:41,270 --> 00:05:39,180

is

159

00:05:42,770 --> 00:05:41,280

um to say that what we normally think

160

00:05:44,930 --> 00:05:42,780

about Consciousness all the assumptions

161

00:05:46,790 --> 00:05:44,940

we make we're wrong we're deluded about

162

00:05:48,529 --> 00:05:46,800

the nature of consciousness

163

00:05:51,290 --> 00:05:48,539

there are lots of ways you can go with

164

00:05:53,870 --> 00:05:51,300

it so more formally the idea is this so

165

00:05:56,029 --> 00:05:53,880

the problem of Consciousness is

166

00:05:59,270 --> 00:05:56,039

basically the mind-body problem How can

167

00:06:01,610 --> 00:05:59,280

there be my experience of looking at at

168

00:06:03,409 --> 00:06:01,620

um Kurt on the screen and the color of

169

00:06:06,230 --> 00:06:03,419

his skin and the walls and the chair

170

00:06:09,230 --> 00:06:06,240

behind and all this experience as well

171

00:06:10,850 --> 00:06:09,240

as neurons that in some way are related

172

00:06:13,129 --> 00:06:10,860

to that now I'm being very cautious

173

00:06:14,210 --> 00:06:13,139

there and saying related to that because

174

00:06:16,310 --> 00:06:14,220

then

175

00:06:19,730 --> 00:06:16,320

um in 1994

176

00:06:22,670 --> 00:06:19,740

um the the term the hard problem was

177

00:06:25,249 --> 00:06:22,680

invented and that that is

178

00:06:27,650 --> 00:06:25,259

um Dave Chalmers uh describes that as

179

00:06:31,309 --> 00:06:27,660

the problem or the question of how

180

00:06:32,809 --> 00:06:31,319

subjective experience arises from uh

181

00:06:34,490 --> 00:06:32,819

brain activity

182

00:06:36,650 --> 00:06:34,500

now as soon as you say that you're

183

00:06:38,809 --> 00:06:36,660

falling into some kind of dualism and he

184

00:06:41,270 --> 00:06:38,819

and and he himself Dave is is a kind of

185

00:06:43,969 --> 00:06:41,280

dualist a very subtle sort of dualist

186

00:06:46,909 --> 00:06:43,979

but the idea of illusionism is that's

187

00:06:48,710 --> 00:06:46,919

the wrong problem we're so deluded that

188

00:06:52,790 --> 00:06:48,720

we imagine Consciousness is something

189

00:06:54,409 --> 00:06:52,800

that arises from brain activity but that

190

00:06:56,150 --> 00:06:54,419

just simply doesn't work and that's why

191

00:06:58,249 --> 00:06:56,160

we've not got anywhere in in

192

00:07:00,890 --> 00:06:58,259

Consciousness studies with with really

193

00:07:03,170 --> 00:07:00,900

trying to solve the hard problem if it's

194

00:07:05,510 --> 00:07:03,180

the wrong the wrong problem what is the

195

00:07:07,909 --> 00:07:05,520

right problem it is the illusion problem

196

00:07:10,249 --> 00:07:07,919

in other words or otherwise known as The

197

00:07:13,550 --> 00:07:10,259

Meta problem of Consciousness it is to

198

00:07:15,770 --> 00:07:13,560

understand how we got so deluded how we

199

00:07:17,150 --> 00:07:15,780

have invented all these Illusions about

200

00:07:20,930 --> 00:07:17,160

the nature of Consciousness and we're

201
00:07:22,430 --> 00:07:20,940
wrong so illusionism is is a kind of way

202
00:07:24,650 --> 00:07:22,440
of approaching the problem of

203
00:07:26,689 --> 00:07:24,660
Consciousness it's not a theory

204
00:07:29,689 --> 00:07:26,699
to kind of line up against Global

205
00:07:31,430 --> 00:07:29,699
workspace or IIT or whatever it is a way

206
00:07:34,909 --> 00:07:31,440
of approaching it that says we won't get

207
00:07:36,710 --> 00:07:34,919
anywhere unless we've understood how we

208
00:07:40,070 --> 00:07:36,720
got into this model in the first place

209
00:07:41,570 --> 00:07:40,080
so illusionists have a go at describing

210
00:07:44,510 --> 00:07:41,580
the illusions

211
00:07:47,270 --> 00:07:44,520
does that help yeah well before Bernardo

212
00:07:49,010 --> 00:07:47,280
comes in I constantly hear that hey if

213
00:07:50,330 --> 00:07:49,020

Consciousness is an illusion and this

214

00:07:51,950 --> 00:07:50,340

may be one of those misinterpretations

215

00:07:53,330 --> 00:07:51,960

but people would say Well it to The

216

00:07:55,010 --> 00:07:53,340

Illusionist if Consciousness is an

217

00:07:56,809 --> 00:07:55,020

illusion who is the illusion occurring

218

00:07:58,490 --> 00:07:56,819

to so then what is your response to that

219

00:08:01,309 --> 00:07:58,500

and then Bernardo please you'll be able

220

00:08:04,850 --> 00:08:01,319

to comment on whatever you would like to

221

00:08:07,189 --> 00:08:04,860

well the the the whom it's two

222

00:08:09,170 --> 00:08:07,199

um is all part of the illusion because

223

00:08:12,050 --> 00:08:09,180

um if you think of it this way um what

224

00:08:15,110 --> 00:08:12,060

is a self if the natural way to imagine

225

00:08:17,990 --> 00:08:15,120

what a self is or who am I am

226

00:08:20,330 --> 00:08:18,000

is to imagine what dandenic calls the

227

00:08:22,550 --> 00:08:20,340

Cartesian theater that is you imagine

228

00:08:24,710 --> 00:08:22,560

and it's I think most of us are like

229

00:08:26,510 --> 00:08:24,720

that most of the time a lot of

230

00:08:28,670 --> 00:08:26,520

meditation you know I've been meditating

231

00:08:31,550 --> 00:08:28,680

for more than 40 years and it blows

232

00:08:34,190 --> 00:08:31,560

apart it to some extent

233

00:08:36,649 --> 00:08:34,200

um maybe eventually completely

234

00:08:39,050 --> 00:08:36,659

um this illusion that I'm sitting inside

235

00:08:40,909 --> 00:08:39,060

my head I'm looking out through my eyes

236

00:08:43,670 --> 00:08:40,919

to see the world I'm listening through

237

00:08:45,829 --> 00:08:43,680

my ears to hear the world and I am in

238

00:08:48,050 --> 00:08:45,839

control I have a stream of conscious

239

00:08:51,110 --> 00:08:48,060

experience and I have free will which

240

00:08:52,910 --> 00:08:51,120

enables me to you know manipulate myself

241

00:08:55,910 --> 00:08:52,920

and the world or this body and the world

242

00:08:58,610 --> 00:08:55,920

so this false idea of the self goes

243

00:09:00,650 --> 00:08:58,620

along with illusionism so who is being

244

00:09:01,730 --> 00:09:00,660

deluded well the whole thing is is a

245

00:09:03,610 --> 00:09:01,740

delusion the whole thing is a

246

00:09:06,110 --> 00:09:03,620

representation

247

00:09:08,870 --> 00:09:06,120

constructed by information processing

248

00:09:09,769 --> 00:09:08,880

system will get set me right on this I'm

249

00:09:12,110 --> 00:09:09,779

sure

250

00:09:14,990 --> 00:09:12,120

um the whole thing is an illusion about

251
00:09:16,550 --> 00:09:15,000
self and other the separation of me and

252
00:09:19,670 --> 00:09:16,560
other people the separation of me and

253
00:09:21,290 --> 00:09:19,680
the world and that gives rise to all

254
00:09:22,490 --> 00:09:21,300
these false ideas about the nature of

255
00:09:24,470 --> 00:09:22,500
consciousness

256
00:09:26,570 --> 00:09:24,480
okay Bernardo what is it you agree with

257
00:09:28,850 --> 00:09:26,580
and do you perhaps disagree with and

258
00:09:31,070 --> 00:09:28,860
perhaps just want to comment on no there

259
00:09:33,110 --> 00:09:31,080
are a lot of things that I agree with

260
00:09:34,910 --> 00:09:33,120
including the illusion of the person of

261
00:09:38,090 --> 00:09:34,920
self I think there is no personal self

262
00:09:40,550 --> 00:09:38,100
it's just not there at all

263
00:09:43,370 --> 00:09:40,560

um the illusion of dualism I don't think

264

00:09:45,889 --> 00:09:43,380

there are two things uh material brain

265

00:09:48,350 --> 00:09:45,899

and phenomenal states that are generated

266

00:09:50,389 --> 00:09:48,360

by the material brain

267

00:09:55,490 --> 00:09:50,399

um but for the position of illusionism

268

00:09:57,650 --> 00:09:55,500

to have use it it has to be specific and

269

00:10:00,710 --> 00:09:57,660

and when you get people talking

270

00:10:02,930 --> 00:10:00,720

specifically about it like lately Keith

271

00:10:05,990 --> 00:10:02,940

Frankish Frankish has been talking about

272

00:10:08,150 --> 00:10:06,000

it rather specifically then it has

273

00:10:09,829 --> 00:10:08,160

become has talked specifically about it

274

00:10:13,449 --> 00:10:09,839

for quite a while

275

00:10:16,370 --> 00:10:13,459

the claim is that the way illusionism

276

00:10:19,009 --> 00:10:16,380

circumvents the hard problem is by

277

00:10:22,850 --> 00:10:19,019

saying that the nominal States or

278

00:10:25,070 --> 00:10:22,860

experiential qualities do not exist that

279

00:10:28,430 --> 00:10:25,080

they are illusions

280

00:10:30,769 --> 00:10:28,440

but then the problem is illusionism is

281

00:10:33,530 --> 00:10:30,779

then either coherent

282

00:10:36,650 --> 00:10:33,540

or it is useless

283

00:10:38,449 --> 00:10:36,660

um it is useless if we say

284

00:10:41,930 --> 00:10:38,459

um

285

00:10:44,990 --> 00:10:41,940

phenomenal States aren't what they seem

286

00:10:47,870 --> 00:10:45,000

that's why they are an illusion

287

00:10:49,730 --> 00:10:47,880

this is coherent but it's useless

288

00:10:51,650 --> 00:10:49,740

because it doesn't do anything about the

289

00:10:54,050 --> 00:10:51,660

heart problem of Consciousness because

290

00:10:54,889 --> 00:10:54,060

the seaming is already a phenomenal

291

00:10:57,110 --> 00:10:54,899

state

292

00:10:59,630 --> 00:10:57,120

that there is an illusion an illusion is

293

00:11:01,670 --> 00:10:59,640

a phenomenal State an illusion in so far

294

00:11:03,829 --> 00:11:01,680

as it is experienced and if it's not

295

00:11:06,350 --> 00:11:03,839

experienced it's not an illusion it's

296

00:11:08,389 --> 00:11:06,360

already an instance of that which one is

297

00:11:09,530 --> 00:11:08,399

trying to get rid of

298

00:11:12,550 --> 00:11:09,540

now

299

00:11:15,050 --> 00:11:12,560

illusionism would be useful if it said

300

00:11:17,810 --> 00:11:15,060

phenomenal states are an illusion in the

301
00:11:23,030 --> 00:11:17,820
sense that they don't really exist they

302
00:11:25,610 --> 00:11:23,040
are edited digests of neuronal processes

303
00:11:28,310 --> 00:11:25,620
and that's why our experiences don't

304
00:11:30,889 --> 00:11:28,320
look like neurons firings and this is

305
00:11:34,430 --> 00:11:30,899
Danny Dennis by the way because our

306
00:11:36,170 --> 00:11:34,440
experience is an edited digest of the

307
00:11:40,550 --> 00:11:36,180
neuronal firings

308
00:11:42,949 --> 00:11:40,560
now this is incoherent because there is

309
00:11:44,090 --> 00:11:42,959
an obvious infinite regress and it goes

310
00:11:47,569 --> 00:11:44,100
as follows

311
00:11:49,550 --> 00:11:47,579
what is that and its digest well it can

312
00:11:51,710 --> 00:11:49,560
only be neuronal processes because for

313
00:11:55,730 --> 00:11:51,720

The Illusionist there is nothing but

314

00:11:58,449 --> 00:11:55,740

neuronal processes so the edit digest of

315

00:12:00,710 --> 00:11:58,459

neuronal processes are themselves

316

00:12:04,069 --> 00:12:00,720

neuronal processes

317

00:12:05,990 --> 00:12:04,079

so why doesn't the edit digest look like

318

00:12:09,110 --> 00:12:06,000

neuronal processes

319

00:12:10,550 --> 00:12:09,120

well because then you have a meta edit

320

00:12:13,250 --> 00:12:10,560

Digest

321

00:12:16,250 --> 00:12:13,260

but that too can only be neuronal

322

00:12:18,829 --> 00:12:16,260

processes so you need a Meta Meta added

323

00:12:19,730 --> 00:12:18,839

digest and you fall into Infinite

324

00:12:22,430 --> 00:12:19,740

regress

325

00:12:25,069 --> 00:12:22,440

so my position is illusionism has to be

326

00:12:26,449 --> 00:12:25,079

made specific otherwise we are just we

327

00:12:28,490 --> 00:12:26,459

can talk about anything I'm an

328

00:12:32,090 --> 00:12:28,500

Illusionist I think the personal self is

329

00:12:34,370 --> 00:12:32,100

an illusion but like Antonio damasio

330

00:12:36,350 --> 00:12:34,380

claims and I think he is writing that

331

00:12:38,449 --> 00:12:36,360

claim the problems that he conflates

332

00:12:41,090 --> 00:12:38,459

that with the claim that Consciousness

333

00:12:42,829 --> 00:12:41,100

is not there Consciousness is not a

334

00:12:45,829 --> 00:12:42,839

personal self it's not a soul it's

335

00:12:47,750 --> 00:12:45,839

phenomenal States it has a a precise

336

00:12:49,970 --> 00:12:47,760

definition so you have to make it

337

00:12:52,250 --> 00:12:49,980

specific and the moment you make it

338

00:12:54,110 --> 00:12:52,260

specific it's either relevant or it's

339

00:12:57,250 --> 00:12:54,120

incoherent

340

00:13:00,170 --> 00:12:57,260

I totally and utterly disagree with you

341

00:13:02,050 --> 00:13:00,180

the one thing that you that I do pick up

342

00:13:04,790 --> 00:13:02,060

on that I should have said myself was

343

00:13:06,590 --> 00:13:04,800

look at illusion

344

00:13:08,090 --> 00:13:06,600

um in the dictionary because what

345

00:13:10,430 --> 00:13:08,100

happened was Dan Dennett and I

346

00:13:12,350 --> 00:13:10,440

frequently used to get accused of saying

347

00:13:15,590 --> 00:13:12,360

Consciousness doesn't exist I'm like

348

00:13:19,850 --> 00:13:15,600

what look you know ah

349

00:13:23,810 --> 00:13:21,650

some dictionaries and looked up illusion

350

00:13:25,670 --> 00:13:23,820

and and as you described it it means

351

00:13:28,490 --> 00:13:25,680

something that is not what it seems to

352

00:13:30,710 --> 00:13:28,500

be and that is all illusionism is saying

353

00:13:32,690 --> 00:13:30,720

now illusionism is not claiming as I

354

00:13:34,730 --> 00:13:32,700

said before it's not claiming to be

355

00:13:37,370 --> 00:13:34,740

specific it's not claiming to be a

356

00:13:39,949 --> 00:13:37,380

theory that can be tested against other

357

00:13:41,269 --> 00:13:39,959

theories like IIT or higher order

358

00:13:43,370 --> 00:13:41,279

thoughts or you know all the other

359

00:13:46,430 --> 00:13:43,380

theories of Consciousness it's an

360

00:13:48,350 --> 00:13:46,440

approach that says we've got it so badly

361

00:13:49,790 --> 00:13:48,360

wrong we need to start again from the

362

00:13:52,129 --> 00:13:49,800

beginning now one way to start again

363

00:13:53,810 --> 00:13:52,139

might be to idealism well I'm sure come

364

00:13:56,090 --> 00:13:53,820

on to that it wouldn't be the way that I

365

00:13:58,009 --> 00:13:56,100

go but there may be other ways to go but

366

00:13:59,449 --> 00:13:58,019

you said unless it's specific it can't

367

00:14:01,430 --> 00:13:59,459

solve the hard problem but it's not

368

00:14:03,530 --> 00:14:01,440

trying to solve the hard problem it's

369

00:14:05,090 --> 00:14:03,540

trying to say look the hard problem is

370

00:14:08,210 --> 00:14:05,100

completely wrong because it's deal is

371

00:14:10,790 --> 00:14:08,220

from the start and it asks us to solve a

372

00:14:12,790 --> 00:14:10,800

problem that doesn't really exist what

373

00:14:17,030 --> 00:14:12,800

we need to do is work out

374

00:14:19,490 --> 00:14:17,040

just how how we are imagining our

375

00:14:21,590 --> 00:14:19,500

Consciousness to be and see why that

376

00:14:23,090 --> 00:14:21,600

happened now you talked about you said

377

00:14:26,389 --> 00:14:23,100

something like an illusionist says

378

00:14:28,430 --> 00:14:26,399

subjective states don't exist well I I

379

00:14:29,690 --> 00:14:28,440

mean the thing is illusionism is not one

380

00:14:31,310 --> 00:14:29,700

Theory so there are lots of us doing

381

00:14:34,069 --> 00:14:31,320

different things thinking in different

382

00:14:36,050 --> 00:14:34,079

ways but I wouldn't say that subjective

383

00:14:38,230 --> 00:14:36,060

states don't exist I mean as long as

384

00:14:41,150 --> 00:14:38,240

there is a subject I.E a

385

00:14:44,210 --> 00:14:41,160

self-construction a mental model a

386

00:14:46,370 --> 00:14:44,220

representation of a self and there seems

387

00:14:47,629 --> 00:14:46,380

to be a world out there then that's a

388

00:14:49,790 --> 00:14:47,639

subjective state

389

00:14:51,590 --> 00:14:49,800

but it's not in my mind something that

390

00:14:52,970 --> 00:14:51,600

the brain generates

391

00:14:55,370 --> 00:14:52,980

um I mean the brain is constructing

392

00:14:57,290 --> 00:14:55,380

representations and so maybe we need to

393

00:14:59,210 --> 00:14:57,300

ask well why is there something it's

394

00:15:00,710 --> 00:14:59,220

like to be a representation and then you

395

00:15:01,970 --> 00:15:00,720

think well a representation says telling

396

00:15:03,889 --> 00:15:01,980

you what it's like isn't it it's a

397

00:15:05,750 --> 00:15:03,899

representation of that tree and that you

398

00:15:09,590 --> 00:15:05,760

know whatever

399

00:15:11,509 --> 00:15:09,600

um so I I think you're I I can

400

00:15:14,150 --> 00:15:11,519

understand what you're saying about it

401
00:15:17,210 --> 00:15:14,160
needs to be precise but I I and it isn't

402
00:15:20,150 --> 00:15:17,220
because it isn't claiming to be it's not

403
00:15:22,850 --> 00:15:20,160
useless because it will help us I

404
00:15:25,069 --> 00:15:22,860
believe to see through the problems of

405
00:15:27,710 --> 00:15:25,079
the other theories which are not solving

406
00:15:29,449 --> 00:15:27,720
that all the other theories claim to be

407
00:15:32,990 --> 00:15:29,459
approaching at least to the hard problem

408
00:15:35,210 --> 00:15:33,000
and illusionism doesn't and I think in

409
00:15:37,370 --> 00:15:35,220
that sense in a very small way I'm not

410
00:15:38,870 --> 00:15:37,380
claiming a huge amount for it really

411
00:15:41,810 --> 00:15:38,880
um but I think it's the way forward to

412
00:15:45,170 --> 00:15:41,820
go to work out why and how the illusion

413
00:15:47,470 --> 00:15:45,180

appears Illusions illusions of self of

414

00:15:50,389 --> 00:15:47,480

Consciousness and free will all of them

415

00:15:51,889 --> 00:15:50,399

what is illusionism for you if you can

416

00:15:53,870 --> 00:15:51,899

be precise I mean that there are

417

00:15:55,970 --> 00:15:53,880

Illusions going on it's trivial of

418

00:15:59,090 --> 00:15:55,980

course there are the the Consciousness

419

00:16:01,189 --> 00:15:59,100

may not be what it seems it's trivial of

420

00:16:02,750 --> 00:16:01,199

course there are many things we think we

421

00:16:05,449 --> 00:16:02,760

experience but actually it's something

422

00:16:08,090 --> 00:16:05,459

else going on so what is this the the

423

00:16:10,389 --> 00:16:08,100

philosophical metaphysical relevance of

424

00:16:13,790 --> 00:16:10,399

the illusionism and how do you specify

425

00:16:17,269 --> 00:16:13,800

precisely what the claim is because so

426
00:16:18,590 --> 00:16:17,279
far you you just hand waved around the

427
00:16:20,569 --> 00:16:18,600
dictionary meaning of the word

428
00:16:24,170 --> 00:16:20,579
illusionism so so what is the

429
00:16:27,769 --> 00:16:24,180
illusionism illusionism specifically

430
00:16:29,990 --> 00:16:27,779
well for me it is

431
00:16:32,329 --> 00:16:30,000
I I can't say any more than I've I've

432
00:16:34,850 --> 00:16:32,339
really said because I don't know where

433
00:16:36,530 --> 00:16:34,860
it's going I play around with all sorts

434
00:16:38,329 --> 00:16:36,540
of possible solutions I mean I've

435
00:16:39,410 --> 00:16:38,339
thought a lot about idealism I've

436
00:16:41,569 --> 00:16:39,420
thought about a lot about different

437
00:16:44,210 --> 00:16:41,579
kinds of pan psychism I've thought about

438
00:16:46,670 --> 00:16:44,220

all sorts of other things that maybe if

439

00:16:49,670 --> 00:16:46,680

we can see through the illusions

440

00:16:52,850 --> 00:16:49,680

um we will understand how that works now

441

00:16:55,790 --> 00:16:52,860

I would say this if I look around at

442

00:17:00,490 --> 00:16:55,800

this world now

443

00:17:04,130 --> 00:17:00,500

um there seems to be a self and a world

444

00:17:06,530 --> 00:17:04,140

there isn't something else I mean a

445

00:17:08,210 --> 00:17:06,540

materialist will say well that you know

446

00:17:10,610 --> 00:17:08,220

ultimately there's some ultimate

447

00:17:12,409 --> 00:17:10,620

underlying whatever it is

448

00:17:14,510 --> 00:17:12,419

um uh with the forces of nature and

449

00:17:16,429 --> 00:17:14,520

whatever and this is arising from that

450

00:17:18,650 --> 00:17:16,439

and there is a sort of natural

451

00:17:20,870 --> 00:17:18,660

separation between

452

00:17:23,329 --> 00:17:20,880

um experience and the world that we're

453

00:17:25,850 --> 00:17:23,339

experiencing that seems to me that's

454

00:17:28,370 --> 00:17:25,860

part of what the illusion is and how do

455

00:17:30,409 --> 00:17:28,380

we get by that it seems to me that

456

00:17:31,669 --> 00:17:30,419

that's what you're trying to do is is to

457

00:17:33,530 --> 00:17:31,679

get past that

458

00:17:34,549 --> 00:17:33,540

I don't have an answer so I mean you're

459

00:17:37,010 --> 00:17:34,559

you're both going to be really

460

00:17:39,110 --> 00:17:37,020

frustrated with me because I'm not going

461

00:17:41,150 --> 00:17:39,120

to say that I have an answer that to set

462

00:17:43,669 --> 00:17:41,160

against your answer I'm just saying that

463

00:17:46,190 --> 00:17:43,679

we're so deeply confused we have to

464

00:17:48,950 --> 00:17:46,200

throw out an awful lot and and start

465

00:17:50,990 --> 00:17:48,960

again I'm sorry if that is not you know

466

00:17:54,110 --> 00:17:51,000

not enough it's not enough meat if you

467

00:17:56,090 --> 00:17:54,120

like but it's very interesting um we've

468

00:17:59,630 --> 00:17:56,100

both mentioned Dennett I mean back in

469

00:18:01,250 --> 00:17:59,640

1991 in Consciousness explained the book

470

00:18:03,890 --> 00:18:01,260

that so many people say should be called

471

00:18:06,110 --> 00:18:03,900

Consciousness explained away that means

472

00:18:10,850 --> 00:18:06,120

they haven't got what he's trying to do

473

00:18:13,789 --> 00:18:10,860

at all that book was full of uh traps

474

00:18:15,529 --> 00:18:13,799

that you can fall into the Cartesian

475

00:18:18,230 --> 00:18:15,539

theater I mentioned is just one of them

476

00:18:20,930 --> 00:18:18,240

but for example there's a very very

477

00:18:23,390 --> 00:18:20,940

common idea in most of Consciousness

478

00:18:25,970 --> 00:18:23,400

studies a lot of the research

479

00:18:27,950 --> 00:18:25,980

um which is that some processes in the

480

00:18:30,650 --> 00:18:27,960

brain are conscious and some other

481

00:18:33,770 --> 00:18:30,660

processes in the brain are not conscious

482

00:18:36,470 --> 00:18:33,780

now what on Earth could this mean

483

00:18:38,510 --> 00:18:36,480

um do some have qualier attached

484

00:18:39,830 --> 00:18:38,520

um and some don't to some sort of

485

00:18:40,370 --> 00:18:39,840

magically

486

00:18:43,909 --> 00:18:40,380

um

487

00:18:46,669 --> 00:18:43,919

it it you know uh give rise to ex

488

00:18:50,090 --> 00:18:46,679

produce

489

00:18:53,930 --> 00:18:50,100

um something called experience

490

00:18:56,390 --> 00:18:53,940

um uh or colors or or any kind of

491

00:18:58,669 --> 00:18:56,400

experience it it doesn't really make any

492

00:19:01,250 --> 00:18:58,679

sense that's just one of them but that

493

00:19:03,230 --> 00:19:01,260

whole thing has led to this search for

494

00:19:06,590 --> 00:19:03,240

the neural correlates of Consciousness

495

00:19:08,810 --> 00:19:06,600

now I think as an Illusionist

496

00:19:11,270 --> 00:19:08,820

that that is one of the things that

497

00:19:14,150 --> 00:19:11,280

illusionism helps you to see and that

498

00:19:16,130 --> 00:19:14,160

danit's work has helped me to see

499

00:19:18,650 --> 00:19:16,140

um that that is a false distinction

500

00:19:20,330 --> 00:19:18,660

there there are not conscious and

501
00:19:22,549 --> 00:19:20,340
unconscious processes on the brain it's

502
00:19:25,010 --> 00:19:22,559
a category mistake if you like

503
00:19:27,470 --> 00:19:25,020
so those are the kind of things that I

504
00:19:29,570 --> 00:19:27,480
find helpful in digging down and digging

505
00:19:31,490 --> 00:19:29,580
down into the problem and hoping that

506
00:19:32,390 --> 00:19:31,500
something will become clearer than it is

507
00:19:34,250 --> 00:19:32,400
now

508
00:19:36,049 --> 00:19:34,260
and it's not to deny that there's

509
00:19:37,850 --> 00:19:36,059
experience that's what we're trying to

510
00:19:40,010 --> 00:19:37,860
struggle with

511
00:19:42,169 --> 00:19:40,020
Sue briefly are you a materialist or you

512
00:19:44,210 --> 00:19:42,179
don't subscribe to that no I'm not a

513
00:19:47,510 --> 00:19:44,220

materialist because I'm probably for

514

00:19:49,970 --> 00:19:47,520

probably the same reasons as Bernardo

515

00:19:52,850 --> 00:19:49,980

um it doesn't work I mean it it gives

516

00:19:56,090 --> 00:19:52,860

rise to the hard problem which is to my

517

00:19:58,490 --> 00:19:56,100

mind an idiot problem it's you know it

518

00:20:00,950 --> 00:19:58,500

doesn't make sense to say that that

519

00:20:03,710 --> 00:20:00,960

experience arises from brain processes

520

00:20:06,830 --> 00:20:03,720

either it's got to be brain processes in

521

00:20:08,750 --> 00:20:06,840

some way or we've got to have some other

522

00:20:10,789 --> 00:20:08,760

kind of theory

523

00:20:13,789 --> 00:20:10,799

um does that kind of answer sure

524

00:20:15,049 --> 00:20:13,799

Bernardo

525

00:20:17,270 --> 00:20:15,059

um

526

00:20:21,470 --> 00:20:17,280

I think the last comment you made is is

527

00:20:23,150 --> 00:20:21,480

almost ends the debate we can now just

528

00:20:24,770 --> 00:20:23,160

Converse

529

00:20:27,110 --> 00:20:24,780

um it's a lot sorry I didn't I didn't

530

00:20:28,970 --> 00:20:27,120

the last comment you made that

531

00:20:31,490 --> 00:20:28,980

materialism doesn't work because of the

532

00:20:33,289 --> 00:20:31,500

heart problem it sort of ends the debate

533

00:20:34,970 --> 00:20:33,299

we can now just I'm not saying

534

00:20:36,830 --> 00:20:34,980

naturalism doesn't work that's a

535

00:20:39,049 --> 00:20:36,840

different statement isn't it naturalism

536

00:20:41,870 --> 00:20:39,059

is not the same as materialism I said

537

00:20:46,070 --> 00:20:41,880

materialism oh sorry sorry I am a

538

00:20:48,289 --> 00:20:46,080

naturalist too right fine

539

00:20:50,090 --> 00:20:48,299

um I didn't mean when I asked the

540

00:20:52,669 --> 00:20:50,100

question that you'd be more specific I

541

00:20:55,370 --> 00:20:52,679

didn't mean to to ask you to give me a

542

00:20:56,810 --> 00:20:55,380

metaphysical Theory and let alone a

543

00:20:59,510 --> 00:20:56,820

complete one

544

00:21:01,130 --> 00:20:59,520

um I asked you to specify the hypothesis

545

00:21:03,770 --> 00:21:01,140

you are defending because I can only

546

00:21:05,750 --> 00:21:03,780

agree or disagree if I know what it is

547

00:21:07,850 --> 00:21:05,760

that you are defending what it is that

548

00:21:11,390 --> 00:21:07,860

your position is

549

00:21:13,789 --> 00:21:11,400

um but as you just said what you call

550

00:21:16,130 --> 00:21:13,799

illusionism is not what

551

00:21:17,750 --> 00:21:16,140

the vast majority at least of

552

00:21:20,390 --> 00:21:17,760

philosophers out there writing about

553

00:21:23,210 --> 00:21:20,400

illusionism consider illusionism to be

554

00:21:26,930 --> 00:21:23,220

the the relevance of illusionism in

555

00:21:30,230 --> 00:21:26,940

philosophy today is the attempt to deny

556

00:21:34,630 --> 00:21:30,240

the existence of phenomenal states of

557

00:21:38,450 --> 00:21:36,890

because I'm not a philosopher I know

558

00:21:40,610 --> 00:21:38,460

more about psychologists than than

559

00:21:43,970 --> 00:21:40,620

philosophers but who is saying that that

560

00:21:46,490 --> 00:21:43,980

these states don't exist uh Keith

561

00:21:49,250 --> 00:21:46,500

Frankish says that there is an important

562

00:21:51,770 --> 00:21:49,260

sense in which experiential states do

563

00:21:54,169 --> 00:21:51,780

not have phenomenal properties that's

564

00:21:56,149 --> 00:21:54,179

what he says they do not have phenomenal

565

00:21:57,470 --> 00:21:56,159

properties as in descriptions of qualia

566

00:21:59,750 --> 00:21:57,480

he doesn't say they don't exist the

567

00:22:02,450 --> 00:21:59,760

nominal states are phenomenal properties

568

00:22:04,190 --> 00:22:02,460

if states do not have phenomenal

569

00:22:07,310 --> 00:22:04,200

properties they are not phenomenal

570

00:22:09,830 --> 00:22:07,320

states that you cannot argue out of it

571

00:22:11,630 --> 00:22:09,840

and microgracia you ask me for examples

572

00:22:14,630 --> 00:22:11,640

so I'm giving you examples let me answer

573

00:22:16,970 --> 00:22:14,640

Michael graciano is on record saying

574

00:22:19,610 --> 00:22:16,980

Consciousness does not exist it's

575

00:22:22,130 --> 00:22:19,620

something that doesn't happen so that's

576

00:22:25,250 --> 00:22:22,140

what is being peddled out there and

577

00:22:27,470 --> 00:22:25,260

Keith is quite explicit he although

578

00:22:29,690 --> 00:22:27,480

he dances an impossible dance because

579

00:22:33,230 --> 00:22:29,700

what he says is that

580

00:22:34,610 --> 00:22:33,240

we think we have phenomenal States when

581

00:22:38,750 --> 00:22:34,620

we introspect

582

00:22:40,789 --> 00:22:38,760

because everything happens as though we

583

00:22:42,710 --> 00:22:40,799

had phenomenal States

584

00:22:45,830 --> 00:22:42,720

but we don't

585

00:22:49,250 --> 00:22:45,840

the problem is that the nominal states

586

00:22:53,390 --> 00:22:49,260

are the only instance of something that

587

00:22:56,870 --> 00:22:53,400

the seeming of it is already it the

588

00:23:00,310 --> 00:22:56,880

illusion of it is already it and after

589

00:23:04,490 --> 00:23:00,320

he goes through a tortuous conceptual

590

00:23:06,430 --> 00:23:04,500

acrobatic acrobatics he says but yes we

591

00:23:08,390 --> 00:23:06,440

don't have the answer yet for how

592

00:23:10,789 --> 00:23:08,400

non-phenomenal states can represent

593

00:23:12,830 --> 00:23:10,799

phenomenal States well that's the only

594

00:23:15,350 --> 00:23:12,840

question that matters that's the

595

00:23:18,169 --> 00:23:15,360

question that started the whole thing so

596

00:23:21,649 --> 00:23:18,179

if you ask me Susan I think illusionism

597

00:23:24,230 --> 00:23:21,659

is a [h__\h] show in philosophy it's just a

598

00:23:27,350 --> 00:23:24,240

bunch of vague hand-waving conceptual

599

00:23:30,230 --> 00:23:27,360

acrobatics and contortions that only

600

00:23:33,230 --> 00:23:30,240

postpone the problem and hide it behind

601
00:23:36,470 --> 00:23:33,240
an absolute absolute lack of clarity of

602
00:23:39,770 --> 00:23:36,480
thinking now all materialism it's the

603
00:23:41,210 --> 00:23:39,780
only game in town because given the hard

604
00:23:43,370 --> 00:23:41,220
problem of Consciousness the

605
00:23:45,950 --> 00:23:43,380
irreducibility of qualities to to

606
00:23:48,470 --> 00:23:45,960
quantitative parameters you have to find

607
00:23:50,270 --> 00:23:48,480
a way to argue that phenomenal States in

608
00:23:52,909 --> 00:23:50,280
a very significant sense are not there

609
00:23:54,529 --> 00:23:52,919
so you end up dancing this dance in

610
00:23:56,510 --> 00:23:54,539
which people say well of course there

611
00:23:58,250 --> 00:23:56,520
are subjective States we can't deny that

612
00:24:00,049 --> 00:23:58,260
and then they proceed to argue that

613
00:24:02,270 --> 00:24:00,059

there aren't subjective States

614

00:24:04,490 --> 00:24:02,280

what the hell is this that's why I keep

615

00:24:07,310 --> 00:24:04,500

asking you to be specific and precise

616

00:24:09,890 --> 00:24:07,320

because illusionism is now so slippery

617

00:24:12,169 --> 00:24:09,900

that whatever you think it is it is and

618

00:24:13,490 --> 00:24:12,179

you argue against that the Defenders

619

00:24:16,610 --> 00:24:13,500

will say well that's not what I mean

620

00:24:19,430 --> 00:24:16,620

what is it that what the hell then is it

621

00:24:22,010 --> 00:24:19,440

that you mean and my my conclusion is

622

00:24:25,730 --> 00:24:22,020

what I said from the beginning it is

623

00:24:27,529 --> 00:24:25,740

either useful or it is coherent it

624

00:24:29,990 --> 00:24:27,539

doesn't go both ways now I understand

625

00:24:33,710 --> 00:24:30,000

that what you consider to be illusionism

626

00:24:35,930 --> 00:24:33,720

is a a much less specific thing you are

627

00:24:37,430 --> 00:24:35,940

just focused on the dictionary meaning

628

00:24:39,649 --> 00:24:37,440

of the word illusion and you're saying

629

00:24:41,690 --> 00:24:39,659

well there are Illusions yes there are

630

00:24:44,570 --> 00:24:41,700

Illusions and seeing through them can

631

00:24:49,010 --> 00:24:44,580

help us yes saying through our Illusions

632

00:24:51,710 --> 00:24:49,020

can help us but it's almost the issue

633

00:24:54,049 --> 00:24:51,720

you see it's it's completely true it

634

00:24:55,730 --> 00:24:54,059

says nothing it's not doing anything

635

00:24:57,649 --> 00:24:55,740

when you talk about Illusions like that

636

00:24:59,270 --> 00:24:57,659

you seem to be talking and earlier as

637

00:25:00,310 --> 00:24:59,280

well about

638

00:25:03,529 --> 00:25:00,320

um

639

00:25:05,210 --> 00:25:03,539

perception reality kind of errors and

640

00:25:06,830 --> 00:25:05,220

this isn't like that this is this is

641

00:25:09,110 --> 00:25:06,840

having an illusion about the whole

642

00:25:11,090 --> 00:25:09,120

nature of every moment of experience

643

00:25:14,090 --> 00:25:11,100

that we have

644

00:25:16,789 --> 00:25:14,100

um going back to Frankish

645

00:25:19,130 --> 00:25:16,799

um in that uh book that special issue of

646

00:25:21,490 --> 00:25:19,140

Journal of Consciousness studies you may

647

00:25:24,649 --> 00:25:21,500

see that in the beginning of my piece I

648

00:25:27,110 --> 00:25:24,659

dissociate from his idea that

649

00:25:29,029 --> 00:25:27,120

um that experiences don't have the

650

00:25:31,490 --> 00:25:29,039

states don't have phenomenal properties

651
00:25:34,549 --> 00:25:31,500
because I I can't go along with him on

652
00:25:36,409 --> 00:25:34,559
that and so in a way I'm weaker in my

653
00:25:39,350 --> 00:25:36,419
argument but

654
00:25:41,570 --> 00:25:39,360
um and you can criticize me for that but

655
00:25:43,549 --> 00:25:41,580
I still think it's essential for us to

656
00:25:45,289 --> 00:25:43,559
tackle the current theories all of which

657
00:25:47,090 --> 00:25:45,299
fall into these kind of traps I mean I

658
00:25:48,590 --> 00:25:47,100
talk about one of them and the whole

659
00:25:50,390 --> 00:25:48,600
hunt for the neural correlates of

660
00:25:52,730 --> 00:25:50,400
Consciousness again and again people are

661
00:25:53,390 --> 00:25:52,740
falling into the traps that then it laid

662
00:25:56,510 --> 00:25:53,400
out

663
00:25:58,909 --> 00:25:56,520

but you mentioned Michael Graziano

664

00:26:01,490 --> 00:25:58,919

um and it's very interesting that he

665

00:26:04,610 --> 00:26:01,500

refuses to be called an illusionist now

666

00:26:06,769 --> 00:26:04,620

he's probably being quite canny here and

667

00:26:08,930 --> 00:26:06,779

it may pay off because people don't like

668

00:26:12,350 --> 00:26:08,940

the word illusionism and he doesn't want

669

00:26:14,630 --> 00:26:12,360

to be associated with it but I think his

670

00:26:16,669 --> 00:26:14,640

theory is absolutely a version of

671

00:26:18,289 --> 00:26:16,679

illusionism and I think it's the best

672

00:26:21,169 --> 00:26:18,299

theory we've got at the moment although

673

00:26:23,930 --> 00:26:21,179

it doesn't solve all the problems but he

674

00:26:27,110 --> 00:26:23,940

is basically saying

675

00:26:29,149 --> 00:26:27,120

um just as we have a body schemer so so

676

00:26:30,350 --> 00:26:29,159

his theory for anyone listening is

677

00:26:36,049 --> 00:26:30,360

attention

678

00:26:37,310 --> 00:26:36,059

idea of a schema is quite important I'm

679

00:26:39,529 --> 00:26:37,320

particularly interested in the body

680

00:26:43,070 --> 00:26:39,539

schema which you use to compare with it

681

00:26:46,250 --> 00:26:43,080

so all the time our body are break the

682

00:26:48,110 --> 00:26:46,260

whole nervous system is constructing

683

00:26:49,850 --> 00:26:48,120

um our model or representation of where

684

00:26:51,830 --> 00:26:49,860

our body is and what it's doing this is

685

00:26:54,289 --> 00:26:51,840

called the body schema I'm particularly

686

00:26:56,090 --> 00:26:54,299

interested in this because we now know

687

00:26:58,250 --> 00:26:56,100

that this is what goes awry in an

688

00:26:59,930 --> 00:26:58,260

out-of-body experience and I've done a

689

00:27:02,390 --> 00:26:59,940

lot of work on upper body and near-death

690

00:27:04,310 --> 00:27:02,400

experiences and so on so I'm very

691

00:27:08,029 --> 00:27:04,320

familiar with that idea now the idea of

692

00:27:10,490 --> 00:27:08,039

an attention schema is that any

693

00:27:13,370 --> 00:27:10,500

um complex information processing system

694

00:27:14,870 --> 00:27:13,380

has a divert energy of resources to

695

00:27:17,750 --> 00:27:14,880

different things all over the place and

696

00:27:21,470 --> 00:27:17,760

we call this attention in in humans and

697

00:27:25,190 --> 00:27:21,480

other animals and that

698

00:27:28,130 --> 00:27:25,200

um experience at any time is what is

699

00:27:29,690 --> 00:27:28,140

represented in the attention schema now

700

00:27:32,510 --> 00:27:29,700

this is an interesting way of going

701
00:27:34,669 --> 00:27:32,520
about it because it's not having an

702
00:27:37,730 --> 00:27:34,679
outside world with objects that then

703
00:27:38,810 --> 00:27:37,740
have to have properties that we to have

704
00:27:41,210 --> 00:27:38,820
phenomenal properties because we're

705
00:27:43,430 --> 00:27:41,220
looking at an object it's it's mapping

706
00:27:45,769 --> 00:27:43,440
or representing the attention schema

707
00:27:47,930 --> 00:27:45,779
instead now whether this gets us

708
00:27:49,730 --> 00:27:47,940
anywhere I don't know but I've spent

709
00:27:52,850 --> 00:27:49,740
quite a lot of time playing around with

710
00:27:55,010 --> 00:27:52,860
the idea of observing in different

711
00:27:57,529 --> 00:27:55,020
states of Consciousness

712
00:27:59,630 --> 00:27:57,539
um whether it feels like

713
00:28:01,370 --> 00:27:59,640

um an attention schema and that's quite

714

00:28:03,470 --> 00:28:01,380

fun I've been doing the same with um

715

00:28:05,630 --> 00:28:03,480

predictive processing Theory and active

716

00:28:08,029 --> 00:28:05,640

inference and so on which kind of does

717

00:28:10,370 --> 00:28:08,039

slightly relate to it

718

00:28:12,010 --> 00:28:10,380

um and this leads me to another thought

719

00:28:14,570 --> 00:28:12,020

that I have which is

720

00:28:16,730 --> 00:28:14,580

there's there are lots and lots of ways

721

00:28:19,010 --> 00:28:16,740

of going about the the problem of

722

00:28:21,110 --> 00:28:19,020

Consciousness but one of them for me is

723

00:28:23,390 --> 00:28:21,120

through personal practice of mindfulness

724

00:28:25,070 --> 00:28:23,400

meditation taking psychedelic drugs all

725

00:28:27,289 --> 00:28:25,080

kinds of things that change one State of

726

00:28:31,190 --> 00:28:27,299

Consciousness because I feel that that

727

00:28:32,510 --> 00:28:31,200

approach is needed alongside the

728

00:28:34,850 --> 00:28:32,520

scientific approach and the

729

00:28:36,169 --> 00:28:34,860

philosophical approach oh you're nodding

730

00:28:37,310 --> 00:28:36,179

there so I'd like to hear what you think

731

00:28:40,730 --> 00:28:37,320

about that

732

00:28:43,190 --> 00:28:40,740

oh yeah some of you are extremely famous

733

00:28:46,669 --> 00:28:43,200

colleagues I think agree with you but I

734

00:28:48,890 --> 00:28:46,679

I can't say anything more beyond that

735

00:28:51,169 --> 00:28:48,900

um I I agree I think introspection is

736

00:28:52,610 --> 00:28:51,179

one of the royal Avenues to knowledge

737

00:28:55,669 --> 00:28:52,620

especially if you're talking about the

738

00:28:57,230 --> 00:28:55,679

mind uh if one is doing Neuroscience of

739

00:28:59,630 --> 00:28:57,240

Consciousness or philosophy of Mind

740

00:29:02,149 --> 00:28:59,640

introspection is essential so the person

741

00:29:04,549 --> 00:29:02,159

know what he's talking about I mean that

742

00:29:06,830 --> 00:29:04,559

doesn't replace objective studies like

743

00:29:08,690 --> 00:29:06,840

neuroimaging which I think is extremely

744

00:29:10,970 --> 00:29:08,700

valuable it's been getting a lot of

745

00:29:12,529 --> 00:29:10,980

flack recently justifiably to some

746

00:29:15,669 --> 00:29:12,539

extent but I think it's a great advance

747

00:29:18,110 --> 00:29:15,679

of the 21st century it doesn't replace

748

00:29:20,450 --> 00:29:18,120

clinical experience but it's it's

749

00:29:24,350 --> 00:29:20,460

certainly a key component back to

750

00:29:26,570 --> 00:29:24,360

Graziano he's an Illusionist in in the

751
00:29:28,549 --> 00:29:26,580
broad sense that you are using in the

752
00:29:30,230 --> 00:29:28,559
sense that what he's trying to deny is

753
00:29:31,490 --> 00:29:30,240
the existence of some kind of personal

754
00:29:35,389 --> 00:29:31,500
soul

755
00:29:37,789 --> 00:29:35,399
but I mean who would disagree with that

756
00:29:41,750 --> 00:29:37,799
it's it I almost said you're still alive

757
00:29:43,549 --> 00:29:41,760
on the planet today well who amongst the

758
00:29:45,590 --> 00:29:43,559
people who are working seriously on this

759
00:29:47,570 --> 00:29:45,600
would disagree with that so I almost

760
00:29:48,230 --> 00:29:47,580
yawn at that

761
00:29:52,610 --> 00:29:48,240
um

762
00:29:54,889 --> 00:29:52,620
eliminativist as opposed to an

763
00:29:57,950 --> 00:29:54,899

Illusionist because illusionism is the

764

00:30:00,470 --> 00:29:57,960

denial not of it is invited so but the

765

00:30:02,690 --> 00:30:00,480

denial of phenomenal States and that's

766

00:30:04,190 --> 00:30:02,700

not how you are using the word because

767

00:30:06,169 --> 00:30:04,200

you just said you acknowledge the

768

00:30:07,909 --> 00:30:06,179

existence of phenomenal States so

769

00:30:10,850 --> 00:30:07,919

strictly speaking from a philosophical

770

00:30:13,090 --> 00:30:10,860

perspective you aren't an Illusionist so

771

00:30:16,370 --> 00:30:13,100

you I'm not the real thing you are

772

00:30:18,769 --> 00:30:16,380

you're an illusion of one and and if you

773

00:30:21,049 --> 00:30:18,779

if you are not a dualist which it seems

774

00:30:23,210 --> 00:30:21,059

you are not and you want knowledge the

775

00:30:26,210 --> 00:30:23,220

existence of phenomenal States then you

776

00:30:28,430 --> 00:30:26,220

are pair Force an idealist semantically

777

00:30:30,950 --> 00:30:28,440

there is no other space for you to land

778

00:30:32,750 --> 00:30:30,960

if you know what I mean what about

779

00:30:34,909 --> 00:30:32,760

um pan psychism

780

00:30:36,169 --> 00:30:34,919

I'm not particularly Landing there but

781

00:30:38,029 --> 00:30:36,179

I'd love to hear what you think about

782

00:30:40,070 --> 00:30:38,039

that because that's the idealism isn't

783

00:30:41,630 --> 00:30:40,080

the only possibility is it

784

00:30:43,430 --> 00:30:41,640

well you just said it was maybe you

785

00:30:46,010 --> 00:30:43,440

could defend that

786

00:30:48,169 --> 00:30:46,020

there are versions of pen psychism that

787

00:30:50,149 --> 00:30:48,179

would that would State the following the

788

00:30:53,149 --> 00:30:50,159

nominal states are not just extra

789

00:30:55,310 --> 00:30:53,159

properties of subatomic particles they

790

00:30:57,529 --> 00:30:55,320

are the essence of subatomic particles

791

00:30:59,450 --> 00:30:57,539

and all the other properties like Mass

792

00:31:02,330 --> 00:30:59,460

charge momentums being these are all

793

00:31:06,250 --> 00:31:02,340

external appearances of that Essence and

794

00:31:10,970 --> 00:31:06,260

that comes down to a form of uh

795

00:31:12,950 --> 00:31:10,980

live it's not like idealism a monad like

796

00:31:15,950 --> 00:31:12,960

Theory

797

00:31:17,990 --> 00:31:15,960

um but that's physically incoherent and

798

00:31:19,669 --> 00:31:18,000

and it amazes me that this stuff is

799

00:31:23,889 --> 00:31:19,679

still talked about because we have known

800

00:31:26,510 --> 00:31:23,899

things at least the 1940s at least since

801
00:31:29,210 --> 00:31:26,520
1949 when Feynman published his famous

802
00:31:30,889 --> 00:31:29,220
Quantum electrodynamics paper with the

803
00:31:32,269 --> 00:31:30,899
defining diagrams and all that stuff

804
00:31:34,669 --> 00:31:32,279
that cotton Nobel Prize we've known

805
00:31:36,889 --> 00:31:34,679
since then that particles are just

806
00:31:39,350 --> 00:31:36,899
metaphors for local excitations of

807
00:31:41,690 --> 00:31:39,360
underlying feuds in other words there

808
00:31:43,250 --> 00:31:41,700
are no particles there's nothing to a

809
00:31:45,710 --> 00:31:43,260
particle but they're underlying field

810
00:31:48,409 --> 00:31:45,720
just as there is nothing to a ripple but

811
00:31:49,970 --> 00:31:48,419
the underlying Lake you can't fish the

812
00:31:52,310 --> 00:31:49,980
Ripple out of the lake because the

813
00:31:54,590 --> 00:31:52,320

Ripple is a doing of the lake it's not a

814

00:31:56,389 --> 00:31:54,600

thing it's a behavior particles are the

815

00:31:58,549 --> 00:31:56,399

same thing particles are behaviors of

816

00:32:01,549 --> 00:31:58,559

underlying Quantum fields and without

817

00:32:03,470 --> 00:32:01,559

this we couldn't begin to make sense of

818

00:32:04,850 --> 00:32:03,480

a great many things we know happen for

819

00:32:07,909 --> 00:32:04,860

instance we couldn't make sense of

820

00:32:09,769 --> 00:32:07,919

particle Decay a Higgs boson can Decay

821

00:32:12,409 --> 00:32:09,779

into two quarks

822

00:32:15,289 --> 00:32:12,419

or or two mules which are heavy

823

00:32:16,789 --> 00:32:15,299

electrons but there aren't two melons in

824

00:32:19,730 --> 00:32:16,799

the hex Boson

825

00:32:22,549 --> 00:32:19,740

so how how does it become Two Mules well

826

00:32:24,470 --> 00:32:22,559

it's because decaying means that a

827

00:32:26,889 --> 00:32:24,480

particular excitation in the underlying

828

00:32:30,769 --> 00:32:26,899

field in this case the the Higgs field

829

00:32:33,529 --> 00:32:30,779

uh decays one Ripple becomes two other

830

00:32:36,169 --> 00:32:33,539

ripples there is no magic in that but if

831

00:32:39,049 --> 00:32:36,179

you think particles are things then the

832

00:32:41,210 --> 00:32:39,059

Heats both magically disappears and two

833

00:32:43,430 --> 00:32:41,220

muons magically appear it's like what

834

00:32:46,070 --> 00:32:43,440

the hell but I I don't even need to get

835

00:32:48,289 --> 00:32:46,080

to to go that far we wouldn't be able to

836

00:32:51,230 --> 00:32:48,299

explain particle interactions

837

00:32:53,389 --> 00:32:51,240

which is something quantum theory

838

00:32:56,090 --> 00:32:53,399

doesn't give us only Quantum Feud Theory

839

00:32:58,010 --> 00:32:56,100

so there are no particles and psychism

840

00:33:00,889 --> 00:32:58,020

assumes that there are particles with

841

00:33:02,049 --> 00:33:00,899

delineated spatial boundaries and that

842

00:33:04,490 --> 00:33:02,059

they are

843

00:33:06,169 --> 00:33:04,500

self-existing things now this is

844

00:33:08,350 --> 00:33:06,179

physically contradictory it doesn't even

845

00:33:11,210 --> 00:33:08,360

well that's only one version of pants

846

00:33:13,190 --> 00:33:11,220

I'm not going to defend pan psychism but

847

00:33:15,950 --> 00:33:13,200

I I do enjoy playing around with it but

848

00:33:18,830 --> 00:33:15,960

there are lots of other forms that say

849

00:33:22,190 --> 00:33:18,840

um uh only living things can be

850

00:33:23,870 --> 00:33:22,200

conscious or uh only you know higher

851
00:33:26,269 --> 00:33:23,880
order thinking things will be conscious

852
00:33:28,070 --> 00:33:26,279
or I don't know different size objects

853
00:33:30,529 --> 00:33:28,080
there's all sorts of variations or even

854
00:33:32,509 --> 00:33:30,539
just representations

855
00:33:35,389 --> 00:33:32,519
um maybe anything any system that

856
00:33:37,549 --> 00:33:35,399
represents something uh as internal or

857
00:33:39,049 --> 00:33:37,559
or external to itself

858
00:33:41,210 --> 00:33:39,059
um could be

859
00:33:43,310 --> 00:33:41,220
um have experience there's lots of

860
00:33:45,169 --> 00:33:43,320
versions but what I got confused with

861
00:33:46,909 --> 00:33:45,179
what you were saying was I thought you

862
00:33:47,810 --> 00:33:46,919
were just talking about like knits and

863
00:33:51,289 --> 00:33:47,820

then

864

00:33:52,850 --> 00:33:51,299

um how physics and Feynman and so on

865

00:33:55,490 --> 00:33:52,860

um but were you actually talking about

866

00:33:59,570 --> 00:33:55,500

what you believe because what is this

867

00:34:01,610 --> 00:33:59,580

underlying field if you are an idealist

868

00:34:03,830 --> 00:34:01,620

um what do you mean by an underlying

869

00:34:10,129 --> 00:34:06,950

deals under quantum theory are our

870

00:34:11,810 --> 00:34:10,139

models we model nature in terms of

871

00:34:14,030 --> 00:34:11,820

fields and fields are spatially

872

00:34:16,550 --> 00:34:14,040

distributed they exist in every point of

873

00:34:18,470 --> 00:34:16,560

space-time that's the model of a field

874

00:34:20,869 --> 00:34:18,480

but everything in science is a

875

00:34:23,270 --> 00:34:20,879

convenient fiction like when Newton

876

00:34:25,550 --> 00:34:23,280

proposed this invisible force acting at

877

00:34:27,050 --> 00:34:25,560

a distance instantaneously between the

878

00:34:29,450 --> 00:34:27,060

Earth and the moon the force of gravity

879

00:34:31,129 --> 00:34:29,460

that was a convenient fiction today it's

880

00:34:33,770 --> 00:34:31,139

no longer convenient we know there is no

881

00:34:35,750 --> 00:34:33,780

such Force gravity is a distortion of

882

00:34:39,230 --> 00:34:35,760

space-time a bending of space-time

883

00:34:41,690 --> 00:34:39,240

actually even that later convenient

884

00:34:44,409 --> 00:34:41,700

fiction is now Falling by the wayside

885

00:34:49,070 --> 00:34:44,419

because now with Quantum Loop gravity

886

00:34:51,770 --> 00:34:49,080

that whole thing is being revised so we

887

00:34:55,450 --> 00:34:51,780

shouldn't take the 17 Quantum fields

888

00:34:58,490 --> 00:34:55,460

that exist today at real existence

889

00:35:00,829 --> 00:34:58,500

because they are just conceptual models

890

00:35:03,470 --> 00:35:00,839

that allow us to to predict the Nature's

891

00:35:05,390 --> 00:35:03,480

Behavior now what it does tell us is

892

00:35:06,950 --> 00:35:05,400

that whatever is going on it's not

893

00:35:09,829 --> 00:35:06,960

spatially localized

894

00:35:12,050 --> 00:35:09,839

the world is not made of little bricks

895

00:35:14,050 --> 00:35:12,060

that are put together that's not how

896

00:35:17,210 --> 00:35:14,060

nature Works

897

00:35:18,710 --> 00:35:17,220

unless you make that step to Fields a

898

00:35:20,810 --> 00:35:18,720

great many things would break you

899

00:35:23,569 --> 00:35:20,820

wouldn't be able to reconcile

900

00:35:24,950 --> 00:35:23,579

um quantum theory with relativity you

901
00:35:26,150 --> 00:35:24,960
wouldn't be able to explain particle

902
00:35:27,770 --> 00:35:26,160
interaction you wouldn't be able to

903
00:35:30,609 --> 00:35:27,780
explain particle Decay you wouldn't be

904
00:35:33,410 --> 00:35:30,619
able to explain the quantum foam or

905
00:35:34,550 --> 00:35:33,420
spontaneous Quantum excitations and

906
00:35:39,109 --> 00:35:34,560
therefore you wouldn't be able to

907
00:35:41,329 --> 00:35:39,119
explain uh um what people call 0.4s

908
00:35:43,130 --> 00:35:41,339
which is casimir's effect which is

909
00:35:46,250 --> 00:35:43,140
experimental experimentally demonstrated

910
00:35:49,730 --> 00:35:46,260
so what what these models are telling us

911
00:35:51,650 --> 00:35:49,740
is that at the bottom level nature is

912
00:35:54,290 --> 00:35:51,660
not spatially localized

913
00:35:56,750 --> 00:35:54,300

that's the the bottle the bottleneck and

914

00:35:59,390 --> 00:35:56,760

it dovetails nicely with idealism at

915

00:36:02,270 --> 00:35:59,400

least with objective forms of idealism

916

00:36:04,670 --> 00:36:02,280

which say yes there is a world out there

917

00:36:07,190 --> 00:36:04,680

it's not in our minds it's not

918

00:36:09,890 --> 00:36:07,200

susceptible to our fantasy Ro wishes or

919

00:36:11,990 --> 00:36:09,900

our affirmations every morning it's

920

00:36:13,609 --> 00:36:12,000

objective from our point of view and it

921

00:36:17,450 --> 00:36:13,619

would it would still be there even if we

922

00:36:19,010 --> 00:36:17,460

were not here but it too is mental in

923

00:36:21,050 --> 00:36:19,020

nature just like my thoughts are

924

00:36:22,490 --> 00:36:21,060

objective from your point of view even

925

00:36:24,710 --> 00:36:22,500

if you are not there I would still be

926
00:36:26,329 --> 00:36:24,720
having thoughts and whatever fantasy you

927
00:36:28,190 --> 00:36:26,339
may entertain it doesn't affect my

928
00:36:29,870 --> 00:36:28,200
thoughts from your point of view my

929
00:36:32,030 --> 00:36:29,880
thoughts are objective but they are out

930
00:36:35,030 --> 00:36:32,040
to there they are outside your personal

931
00:36:37,310 --> 00:36:35,040
mind so the claim is there are mental

932
00:36:39,650 --> 00:36:37,320
processes out there they are not ours

933
00:36:41,450 --> 00:36:39,660
they are objective from our perspective

934
00:36:45,109 --> 00:36:41,460
they are predictable that's why science

935
00:36:46,970 --> 00:36:45,119
Works they are non-localized because

936
00:36:49,069 --> 00:36:46,980
there is only one field of subjectivity

937
00:36:52,250 --> 00:36:49,079
this is critical to avoid the

938
00:36:54,829 --> 00:36:52,260

combination problem and itself nicely

939

00:36:57,530 --> 00:36:54,839

with Feud Theory because the whole the

940

00:36:59,089 --> 00:36:57,540

whole for the past 40 years the whole of

941

00:37:01,910 --> 00:36:59,099

physics is trying to do the so-called

942

00:37:04,190 --> 00:37:01,920

Grand unification Theory sort of folding

943

00:37:08,450 --> 00:37:04,200

gravity into the quantum fields and

944

00:37:10,069 --> 00:37:08,460

going from 17 to 1 and theory was an

945

00:37:12,230 --> 00:37:10,079

attempt and now we have Loop quantum

946

00:37:15,650 --> 00:37:12,240

gravity so it dovetails nicely with that

947

00:37:18,410 --> 00:37:15,660

but forget idealism there are no

948

00:37:21,950 --> 00:37:18,420

particles this is not my belief this is

949

00:37:24,530 --> 00:37:21,960

not my opinion this is textbook Quantum

950

00:37:27,410 --> 00:37:24,540

field Theory it's the basis of the

951
00:37:29,690 --> 00:37:27,420
standard model it's what is guiding us

952
00:37:32,930 --> 00:37:29,700
when we invest billions of dollars or

953
00:37:35,569 --> 00:37:32,940
Euros at CERN this this is not even news

954
00:37:38,210 --> 00:37:35,579
it some would claim we've known that

955
00:37:39,770 --> 00:37:38,220
since 19 the 1920s but at least since

956
00:37:41,990 --> 00:37:39,780
the 1940s

957
00:37:44,630 --> 00:37:42,000
but I don't understand

958
00:37:45,589 --> 00:37:44,640
um the fundamental lack of understanding

959
00:37:49,069 --> 00:37:45,599
I have

960
00:37:50,569 --> 00:37:49,079
is if if you take your idealist View and

961
00:37:52,510 --> 00:37:50,579
you're saying that there is still the

962
00:37:56,089 --> 00:37:52,520
fields

963
00:37:59,329 --> 00:37:56,099

objectively existing why do they behave

964

00:38:01,609 --> 00:37:59,339

the way they do I mean how do you get if

965

00:38:03,050 --> 00:38:01,619

everything is is basically mind or

966

00:38:04,430 --> 00:38:03,060

mental

967

00:38:05,930 --> 00:38:04,440

I'm not sure whether you would say

968

00:38:08,210 --> 00:38:05,940

everything is conscious but anyway if

969

00:38:11,569 --> 00:38:08,220

everything is mental and that comes

970

00:38:13,730 --> 00:38:11,579

first why do we get these apparent laws

971

00:38:16,670 --> 00:38:13,740

of nature the way things behave um the

972

00:38:19,069 --> 00:38:16,680

consistency why I mean at least

973

00:38:21,710 --> 00:38:19,079

materialism has some kind of answers to

974

00:38:23,329 --> 00:38:21,720

the way the world behaves or are you

975

00:38:25,550 --> 00:38:23,339

saying it doesn't

976

00:38:26,810 --> 00:38:25,560

um you know I I just think you shift

977

00:38:29,450 --> 00:38:26,820

from one to the other you shift from

978

00:38:31,190 --> 00:38:29,460

materialism to idealism I don't know

979

00:38:34,550 --> 00:38:31,200

what you've what you've gained in in

980

00:38:36,349 --> 00:38:34,560

doing that well you avoid the dualism

981

00:38:38,329 --> 00:38:36,359

you avoid the hard part avoid dualism

982

00:38:39,950 --> 00:38:38,339

yes absolutely we have to avoid dualism

983

00:38:41,710 --> 00:38:39,960

and you avoid the heart problem of

984

00:38:45,290 --> 00:38:41,720

Consciousness

985

00:38:49,370 --> 00:38:45,300

the notion that something that is mental

986

00:38:52,430 --> 00:38:49,380

in essence cannot behave regularly is

987

00:38:54,950 --> 00:38:52,440

merely a metaphysical Prejudice human

988

00:38:56,930 --> 00:38:54,960

Minds evolved in a planetary ecosystem

989

00:38:59,690 --> 00:38:56,940

and therefore we evolved to be very

990

00:39:01,849 --> 00:38:59,700

reactive and so you could say human

991

00:39:03,829 --> 00:39:01,859

Minds which have developed higher level

992

00:39:05,750 --> 00:39:03,839

mental functions and are reactive to

993

00:39:08,270 --> 00:39:05,760

their environment they are difficult to

994

00:39:09,890 --> 00:39:08,280

predict but although even human Minds

995

00:39:12,530 --> 00:39:09,900

can be predicted and psychology is

996

00:39:14,750 --> 00:39:12,540

making progress in that direction but a

997

00:39:17,270 --> 00:39:14,760

mind without higher level mental

998

00:39:19,250 --> 00:39:17,280

functions can behave according to

999

00:39:21,650 --> 00:39:19,260

precise irregularities why because

1000

00:39:25,010 --> 00:39:21,660

that's what I want to understand why why

1001

00:39:28,370 --> 00:39:25,020

are there these regularities or laws or

1002

00:39:30,050 --> 00:39:28,380

or consistencies and so you say that you

1003

00:39:32,990 --> 00:39:30,060

know our mind

1004

00:39:35,210 --> 00:39:33,000

um it works in particular ways why does

1005

00:39:38,089 --> 00:39:35,220

it produce the appearance of a brain and

1006

00:39:40,730 --> 00:39:38,099

neurons and all of that kind of stuff

1007

00:39:42,650 --> 00:39:40,740

these are two questions so why does it

1008

00:39:44,930 --> 00:39:42,660

behave regularly because it is what it

1009

00:39:47,390 --> 00:39:44,940

is that nature clearly behaves regularly

1010

00:39:49,609 --> 00:39:47,400

I mean whatever metaphysics you have the

1011

00:39:51,470 --> 00:39:49,619

regularity of Nature's behavior is a

1012

00:39:53,030 --> 00:39:51,480

given we can predict what nature will do

1013

00:39:55,490 --> 00:39:53,040

next that's why technology Works

1014

00:39:58,609 --> 00:39:55,500

otherwise it wouldn't but the Prejudice

1015

00:40:01,430 --> 00:39:58,619

is that mind can't behave regularly well

1016

00:40:03,050 --> 00:40:01,440

the news is it does even if it's so

1017

00:40:05,450 --> 00:40:03,060

complex that it's difficult to predict

1018

00:40:07,790 --> 00:40:05,460

it does behave regularly and two we

1019

00:40:09,890 --> 00:40:07,800

cannot anthropomorphize that mind of

1020

00:40:12,170 --> 00:40:09,900

nature out there that can be a very

1021

00:40:13,970 --> 00:40:12,180

probably is a very simple mind didn't

1022

00:40:15,890 --> 00:40:13,980

evolve higher level mental functions in

1023

00:40:18,050 --> 00:40:15,900

a planetary ecosystem it's an

1024

00:40:19,690 --> 00:40:18,060

instinctive spontaneous mind and behaves

1025

00:40:23,210 --> 00:40:19,700

according to regularities

1026

00:40:24,710 --> 00:40:23,220

alligators have very regular Behavior if

1027

00:40:26,870 --> 00:40:24,720

you approach them and you cross a

1028

00:40:28,790 --> 00:40:26,880

certain threshold of distance they may

1029

00:40:30,829 --> 00:40:28,800

Lounge at you but if you don't cross

1030

00:40:33,349 --> 00:40:30,839

that threshold they never try to Lounge

1031

00:40:35,870 --> 00:40:33,359

at you Minds can be very predictable so

1032

00:40:39,670 --> 00:40:35,880

this is not an argument against idealism

1033

00:40:44,510 --> 00:40:39,680

now why does it seem the way way it does

1034

00:40:46,490 --> 00:40:44,520

now it's a technical answer to cut me if

1035

00:40:49,790 --> 00:40:46,500

you think it's going too far but there

1036

00:40:51,770 --> 00:40:49,800

are two reasons for this one is we

1037

00:40:52,849 --> 00:40:51,780

cannot see the world as it actually is

1038

00:40:55,730 --> 00:40:52,859

because there would be information

1039

00:40:57,890 --> 00:40:55,740

overload it's like seeing the files in

1040

00:41:00,290 --> 00:40:57,900

your computer on your desktop exactly

1041

00:41:02,329 --> 00:41:00,300

the way they are millions of open or

1042

00:41:03,770 --> 00:41:02,339

closed microscopic switches that's

1043

00:41:07,130 --> 00:41:03,780

useless it's not it doesn't favor

1044

00:41:09,730 --> 00:41:07,140

survival what you want is to perceive

1045

00:41:12,050 --> 00:41:09,740

the Salient features that are relevant

1046

00:41:14,750 --> 00:41:12,060

that's one answer the other answer is

1047

00:41:17,089 --> 00:41:14,760

entropy control if our intercognitive

1048

00:41:19,790 --> 00:41:17,099

states would mirror the states of the

1049

00:41:21,710 --> 00:41:19,800

world there would be no upper bound to

1050

00:41:23,630 --> 00:41:21,720

our internal entropy because there is no

1051
00:41:26,150 --> 00:41:23,640
a priori upper bounds to the entropy of

1052
00:41:28,030 --> 00:41:26,160
the world so if you were to mirror those

1053
00:41:31,030 --> 00:41:28,040
States in our inner cognitive states

1054
00:41:34,670 --> 00:41:31,040
without a bound to our internal entropy

1055
00:41:37,670 --> 00:41:34,680
and now using an illustrative metaphor

1056
00:41:40,010 --> 00:41:37,680
we could melt into hot meat soup because

1057
00:41:41,930 --> 00:41:40,020
on bounded entropy is not compatible

1058
00:41:43,670 --> 00:41:41,940
with structural and dynamic integrity

1059
00:41:47,930 --> 00:41:43,680
and this has been shown mathematically

1060
00:41:49,609 --> 00:41:47,940
by some neuroscientists so we see the

1061
00:41:52,790 --> 00:41:49,619
relevant and Salient information about

1062
00:41:55,190 --> 00:41:52,800
our environment at a glance and the

1063
00:41:57,230 --> 00:41:55,200

result of that is what we call the

1064

00:41:59,690 --> 00:41:57,240

colloquially physical world the contents

1065

00:42:01,490 --> 00:41:59,700

of the screen of perception that's much

1066

00:42:03,530 --> 00:42:01,500

more conducive to survival and to

1067

00:42:05,810 --> 00:42:03,540

maintaining our internal structural and

1068

00:42:07,730 --> 00:42:05,820

dynamic Integrity then seeing the states

1069

00:42:10,190 --> 00:42:07,740

of the world for what they actually are

1070

00:42:12,230 --> 00:42:10,200

to use another metaphor

1071

00:42:13,849 --> 00:42:12,240

the contents of the screen of perception

1072

00:42:16,010 --> 00:42:13,859

are like the dashboard of an airplane

1073

00:42:17,870 --> 00:42:16,020

the airplane has sensors it makes

1074

00:42:20,089 --> 00:42:17,880

measurements of the states of the sky

1075

00:42:21,710 --> 00:42:20,099

outside and those measurements are

1076

00:42:22,550 --> 00:42:21,720

presented to the pilot in the form of a

1077

00:42:24,349 --> 00:42:22,560

dashboard

1078

00:42:25,910 --> 00:42:24,359

and the pilot can fly based on the

1079

00:42:27,530 --> 00:42:25,920

dashboard alone flying by instruments

1080

00:42:29,810 --> 00:42:27,540

you don't need a transparent windscreen

1081

00:42:31,609 --> 00:42:29,820

to see the world as it actually is guess

1082

00:42:34,130 --> 00:42:31,619

what that's exactly what we do we have

1083

00:42:35,990 --> 00:42:34,140

sensors Eyes Ears tongs surface of the

1084

00:42:38,030 --> 00:42:36,000

skin we make measurements and those

1085

00:42:39,710 --> 00:42:38,040

measurements are presented to to meta

1086

00:42:41,210 --> 00:42:39,720

Consciousness which is different from

1087

00:42:43,190 --> 00:42:41,220

phenomenal States it's something that

1088

00:42:45,349 --> 00:42:43,200

comes on top is presented to meta

1089

00:42:47,810 --> 00:42:45,359

Consciousness in the form of the

1090

00:42:49,910 --> 00:42:47,820

physical world so the physical world is

1091

00:42:52,190 --> 00:42:49,920

an internal dashboard it does convey

1092

00:42:54,650 --> 00:42:52,200

accurate information about the real

1093

00:42:56,690 --> 00:42:54,660

world but it doesn't look like the real

1094

00:42:58,370 --> 00:42:56,700

world because not only does it not need

1095

00:43:00,349 --> 00:42:58,380

to a dashboard it doesn't look like the

1096

00:43:01,910 --> 00:43:00,359

clouds in the sky but because it

1097

00:43:04,730 --> 00:43:01,920

shouldn't in order to control our

1098

00:43:07,370 --> 00:43:04,740

internal entropy and and and facilitate

1099

00:43:09,170 --> 00:43:07,380

uh prompt reactions to environmental

1100

00:43:11,630 --> 00:43:09,180

challenges

1101
00:43:13,490 --> 00:43:11,640
we're all confused now because you're

1102
00:43:15,829 --> 00:43:13,500
talking about

1103
00:43:18,829 --> 00:43:15,839
um the way the world seems and how the

1104
00:43:20,569 --> 00:43:18,839
world really is and almost all of that

1105
00:43:23,390 --> 00:43:20,579
second part of your answer seems to me

1106
00:43:25,970 --> 00:43:23,400
could be spoken by a materialist and

1107
00:43:29,510 --> 00:43:25,980
make perfect sense and I don't see what

1108
00:43:31,670 --> 00:43:29,520
idealism gives you to help with that I

1109
00:43:33,170 --> 00:43:31,680
mean yes of course this is we I've

1110
00:43:34,670 --> 00:43:33,180
talked about attention and attention

1111
00:43:36,589 --> 00:43:34,680
schema Theory

1112
00:43:38,930 --> 00:43:36,599
um we have to pay attention to things

1113
00:43:41,329 --> 00:43:38,940

that matter to us we evolved

1114

00:43:43,490 --> 00:43:41,339

um in we evolved the skills that we have

1115

00:43:45,050 --> 00:43:43,500

and the minds that we have in order to

1116

00:43:47,150 --> 00:43:45,060

survive and get around in the

1117

00:43:49,130 --> 00:43:47,160

environment we are evolved in not to

1118

00:43:50,990 --> 00:43:49,140

have an accurate view of

1119

00:43:52,609 --> 00:43:51,000

um what is

1120

00:43:54,050 --> 00:43:52,619

um actually out there and now you're

1121

00:43:57,170 --> 00:43:54,060

talking about things that are actually

1122

00:43:59,390 --> 00:43:57,180

out there just as a materialist or as a

1123

00:44:02,030 --> 00:43:59,400

dualist would indeed so I'm deeply

1124

00:44:04,490 --> 00:44:02,040

confused now because I don't know what

1125

00:44:07,910 --> 00:44:04,500

idealism what difference idealism makes

1126

00:44:10,609 --> 00:44:07,920

and what it adds and how it helps us it

1127

00:44:12,950 --> 00:44:10,619

takes away a next foreignty category

1128

00:44:14,870 --> 00:44:12,960

that is completely unnecessary namely

1129

00:44:16,609 --> 00:44:14,880

something that is not mind something

1130

00:44:18,829 --> 00:44:16,619

that is not phenomenal something that is

1131

00:44:21,010 --> 00:44:18,839

not mental so you're recording all the

1132

00:44:23,569 --> 00:44:21,020

outside world there so we have our our

1133

00:44:25,010 --> 00:44:23,579

experiences of the world and so on and

1134

00:44:28,730 --> 00:44:25,020

the outside world there you're just

1135

00:44:30,530 --> 00:44:28,740

calling that conscious or mental

1136

00:44:33,109 --> 00:44:30,540

um rather than calling it something

1137

00:44:34,609 --> 00:44:33,119

completely different and physical but

1138

00:44:37,130 --> 00:44:34,619

what does that mean to say that it's

1139

00:44:40,250 --> 00:44:37,140

meant like that's what I just don't get

1140

00:44:42,170 --> 00:44:40,260

it means that it's of the same kind as

1141

00:44:45,470 --> 00:44:42,180

your own intermentation in other words

1142

00:44:47,450 --> 00:44:45,480

it's qualitative in nature it cannot be

1143

00:44:49,130 --> 00:44:47,460

exhaustively described in terms of a

1144

00:44:52,970 --> 00:44:49,140

list of numbers the latter is

1145

00:44:54,770 --> 00:44:52,980

materialism okay and by by avoiding this

1146

00:44:57,349 --> 00:44:54,780

non-mental stuff

1147

00:44:59,329 --> 00:44:57,359

you avoid having to come back from no

1148

00:45:01,370 --> 00:44:59,339

mental stuff to mental stuff which is

1149

00:45:02,930 --> 00:45:01,380

the hard problem of Consciousness you

1150

00:45:04,490 --> 00:45:02,940

avoid this all together so now you're

1151

00:45:07,010 --> 00:45:04,500

saying the world out there is made of

1152

00:45:08,930 --> 00:45:07,020

qualities these are not the qualities of

1153

00:45:11,930 --> 00:45:08,940

my perception these are different

1154

00:45:13,670 --> 00:45:11,940

qualities my perception is an internal

1155

00:45:16,130 --> 00:45:13,680

dashboard representation of the

1156

00:45:17,930 --> 00:45:16,140

qualities that are out there there are

1157

00:45:19,849 --> 00:45:17,940

actual qualities out there and they are

1158

00:45:21,650 --> 00:45:19,859

mental in some kind of nature that I

1159

00:45:23,089 --> 00:45:21,660

don't quite understand what that means

1160

00:45:25,250 --> 00:45:23,099

that they're mental

1161

00:45:28,309 --> 00:45:25,260

they are mentoring the sense that they

1162

00:45:31,190 --> 00:45:28,319

are experienced by Nature they are

1163

00:45:33,530 --> 00:45:31,200

experiential in essence but we don't

1164

00:45:35,630 --> 00:45:33,540

experience those qualities as they are

1165

00:45:38,329 --> 00:45:35,640

we have a representation of those

1166

00:45:40,670 --> 00:45:38,339

qualities so now we have to come from

1167

00:45:42,650 --> 00:45:40,680

qualities to real qualities that are out

1168

00:45:45,230 --> 00:45:42,660

there to the qualities of perception

1169

00:45:47,150 --> 00:45:45,240

that's a much easier Bridge because

1170

00:45:49,309 --> 00:45:47,160

there is no fundamental ontological

1171

00:45:51,290 --> 00:45:49,319

transition now you have mental states of

1172

00:45:53,750 --> 00:45:51,300

one kind modulating mental states of

1173

00:45:55,490 --> 00:45:53,760

another is this coherent of course it is

1174

00:45:57,710 --> 00:45:55,500

it's happening every time every day to

1175

00:45:59,809 --> 00:45:57,720

all all of us your thoughts modulate

1176
00:46:01,790 --> 00:45:59,819
your emotions your emotions modulate

1177
00:46:04,910 --> 00:46:01,800
your thoughts your thoughts modulate

1178
00:46:07,130 --> 00:46:04,920
your fantasies mental states of

1179
00:46:10,730 --> 00:46:07,140
different kinds are modulating one

1180
00:46:13,370 --> 00:46:10,740
another all the time in all of us said

1181
00:46:14,030 --> 00:46:13,380
something a bit contentious there

1182
00:46:15,829 --> 00:46:14,040
um

1183
00:46:18,230 --> 00:46:15,839
about

1184
00:46:20,390 --> 00:46:18,240
um thoughts and emotions

1185
00:46:22,010 --> 00:46:20,400
uh are you saying that the thoughts

1186
00:46:23,569 --> 00:46:22,020
cause the emotions or are you saying

1187
00:46:24,770 --> 00:46:23,579
that they are the same as the emotional

1188
00:46:26,329 --> 00:46:24,780

what what is what are you saying about

1189

00:46:27,829 --> 00:46:26,339

the relationship between thoughts and

1190

00:46:31,430 --> 00:46:27,839

emotions

1191

00:46:34,970 --> 00:46:31,440

they are both mental States so there is

1192

00:46:36,650 --> 00:46:34,980

no antic distinction between them but we

1193

00:46:38,390 --> 00:46:36,660

use different words because there is

1194

00:46:40,430 --> 00:46:38,400

something about it the respective

1195

00:46:41,809 --> 00:46:40,440

qualities that allow us to differentiate

1196

00:46:44,809 --> 00:46:41,819

one from the other

1197

00:46:46,550 --> 00:46:44,819

now if you have a certain emotion it

1198

00:46:48,770 --> 00:46:46,560

changes the kinds of thoughts you are

1199

00:46:51,050 --> 00:46:48,780

liable to having or if you have certain

1200

00:46:52,910 --> 00:46:51,060

kinds of thoughts you become more prone

1201
00:46:55,430 --> 00:46:52,920
to experiencing certain other emotions

1202
00:46:57,890 --> 00:46:55,440
so mental states can modulate other

1203
00:47:00,050 --> 00:46:57,900
mental States trivially it's happening

1204
00:47:02,329 --> 00:47:00,060
all the time that's how minds work so

1205
00:47:04,970 --> 00:47:02,339
all I'm saying now is that there are

1206
00:47:06,490 --> 00:47:04,980
external mental states that modulate our

1207
00:47:09,589 --> 00:47:06,500
internal

1208
00:47:11,930 --> 00:47:09,599
cognitive mental states there is no hard

1209
00:47:14,750 --> 00:47:11,940
problem anymore but there is still an

1210
00:47:16,670 --> 00:47:14,760
external world it's subjective from its

1211
00:47:18,410 --> 00:47:16,680
own point of view but objective from our

1212
00:47:20,750 --> 00:47:18,420
point of view

1213
00:47:22,250 --> 00:47:20,760

I think what why I'm why I'm bothered

1214

00:47:25,430 --> 00:47:22,260

about that was because I'm thinking

1215

00:47:28,069 --> 00:47:25,440

about the time course of thoughts versus

1216

00:47:30,589 --> 00:47:28,079

emotions and what causes what and so on

1217

00:47:32,170 --> 00:47:30,599

and I was imagining an emotion in terms

1218

00:47:34,130 --> 00:47:32,180

of all the

1219

00:47:35,450 --> 00:47:34,140

neurotransmitters and hormones and all

1220

00:47:38,630 --> 00:47:35,460

the other things that give rise to

1221

00:47:40,910 --> 00:47:38,640

bodily feelings and when you say that

1222

00:47:43,849 --> 00:47:40,920

thoughts affect bodily feelings there

1223

00:47:45,170 --> 00:47:43,859

appears to be a problem there but that's

1224

00:47:47,390 --> 00:47:45,180

the problem that you're getting away

1225

00:47:49,190 --> 00:47:47,400

with by saying that that they're all

1226
00:47:51,109 --> 00:47:49,200
mental things affecting each other in a

1227
00:47:53,210 --> 00:47:51,119
mental the whole world is mental stuff

1228
00:47:54,410 --> 00:47:53,220
and obviously that makes sense of mental

1229
00:47:56,450 --> 00:47:54,420
things affecting other mental things

1230
00:47:58,849 --> 00:47:56,460
yeah yeah and and then what are the

1231
00:48:02,750 --> 00:47:58,859
neurotransmitters what are the neuronal

1232
00:48:04,250 --> 00:48:02,760
firings the neurons and all this stuff

1233
00:48:06,530 --> 00:48:04,260
um there are obvious correlations

1234
00:48:08,690 --> 00:48:06,540
between this stuff and what we feel from

1235
00:48:10,730 --> 00:48:08,700
within denying those correlations just

1236
00:48:13,430 --> 00:48:10,740
silly it's just okay then you don't even

1237
00:48:15,530 --> 00:48:13,440
enter the Party If you deny that how can

1238
00:48:20,089 --> 00:48:15,540

we account for that under an idealist

1239

00:48:22,370 --> 00:48:20,099

perspective under idealism all matter

1240

00:48:24,170 --> 00:48:22,380

is a dashboard representation of a

1241

00:48:25,670 --> 00:48:24,180

mental state when observed from across a

1242

00:48:28,190 --> 00:48:25,680

dissociative boundary but they forget

1243

00:48:30,170 --> 00:48:28,200

about it again observed from

1244

00:48:33,170 --> 00:48:30,180

across a dissociative boundary because

1245

00:48:35,450 --> 00:48:33,180

we have to account for why can't can't I

1246

00:48:36,710 --> 00:48:35,460

read your thoughts why do I not know

1247

00:48:39,069 --> 00:48:36,720

what's happening in the galaxy of

1248

00:48:42,589 --> 00:48:39,079

Andromeda if it's all only one big mind

1249

00:48:44,510 --> 00:48:42,599

then why am I not enlightened right so

1250

00:48:46,910 --> 00:48:44,520

we have to account for that and the

1251

00:48:48,950 --> 00:48:46,920

account for that is dissociation which

1252

00:48:50,690 --> 00:48:48,960

is something that Psychiatry now managed

1253

00:48:52,910 --> 00:48:50,700

to show objectively with the Advent of

1254

00:48:54,950 --> 00:48:52,920

neuroimaging that it does happen and it

1255

00:48:56,690 --> 00:48:54,960

can literally make you blind so why

1256

00:48:58,370 --> 00:48:56,700

wouldn't it make you make your blind to

1257

00:49:00,349 --> 00:48:58,380

what's happening in the galaxy of

1258

00:49:02,930 --> 00:49:00,359

Andromeda or in the mind of another

1259

00:49:05,990 --> 00:49:02,940

person and then

1260

00:49:09,470 --> 00:49:06,000

the way it all comes together is

1261

00:49:11,390 --> 00:49:09,480

all matter under idealism is an inner

1262

00:49:12,829 --> 00:49:11,400

cognitive representation of external

1263

00:49:14,569 --> 00:49:12,839

mental States

1264

00:49:16,069 --> 00:49:14,579

when they are observed across a

1265

00:49:19,790 --> 00:49:16,079

dissociative boundary that's what matter

1266

00:49:22,250 --> 00:49:19,800

is now your neurons are made of the same

1267

00:49:23,750 --> 00:49:22,260

atoms and force fields that make up the

1268

00:49:26,630 --> 00:49:23,760

rest of the universe they are also

1269

00:49:28,970 --> 00:49:26,640

material so your neurons are what your

1270

00:49:31,130 --> 00:49:28,980

inner dissociated mental processes look

1271

00:49:33,290 --> 00:49:31,140

like when they are observed from across

1272

00:49:35,030 --> 00:49:33,300

a dissociative boundary your body is

1273

00:49:37,190 --> 00:49:35,040

what your dissociated implementation

1274

00:49:39,170 --> 00:49:37,200

looks like when it is observed from

1275

00:49:41,630 --> 00:49:39,180

across a dissociative boundary and

1276
00:49:43,190 --> 00:49:41,640
represented on a cognitive dashboard so

1277
00:49:45,530 --> 00:49:43,200
to say like the dashboard of an airplane

1278
00:49:52,490 --> 00:49:45,540
can you please give me the simplest

1279
00:49:55,550 --> 00:49:54,410
I mean I'm sort of struggling with you

1280
00:49:58,130 --> 00:49:55,560
you're talking in a lot of different

1281
00:50:00,349 --> 00:49:58,140
ways there and I kind of think I got the

1282
00:50:02,030 --> 00:50:00,359
gist of it but then I'm thinking I

1283
00:50:03,829 --> 00:50:02,040
clearly haven't got this quite right

1284
00:50:05,870 --> 00:50:03,839
because there'll be dissociative

1285
00:50:08,690 --> 00:50:05,880
boundaries within the system and between

1286
00:50:10,430 --> 00:50:08,700
the system and other people and and so

1287
00:50:12,650 --> 00:50:10,440
on but I haven't quite

1288
00:50:14,750 --> 00:50:12,660

got to the bottom of what you mean what

1289

00:50:17,150 --> 00:50:14,760

would be a sort of minimal dissociative

1290

00:50:18,829 --> 00:50:17,160

boundary conceptually a dissociative

1291

00:50:21,109 --> 00:50:18,839

boundaries is what's given by

1292

00:50:22,490 --> 00:50:21,119

inferential isolation but then it gets

1293

00:50:26,150 --> 00:50:22,500

technical so instead of that I will

1294

00:50:27,650 --> 00:50:26,160

appeal to empirical studies and then it

1295

00:50:31,069 --> 00:50:27,660

makes it more and more alive

1296

00:50:33,230 --> 00:50:31,079

so um you may know this in 2015 there

1297

00:50:35,809 --> 00:50:33,240

was this woman a patient of dissociative

1298

00:50:38,329 --> 00:50:35,819

identity disorder in Germany and she had

1299

00:50:40,849 --> 00:50:38,339

many Alters or dissociated centers of

1300

00:50:43,970 --> 00:50:40,859

awareness two of these altars claimed to

1301
00:50:45,530 --> 00:50:43,980
be blind but the human the woman could

1302
00:50:48,109 --> 00:50:45,540
see perfectly well her eyes were okay

1303
00:50:49,970 --> 00:50:48,119
her visual cortex was okay her Optical

1304
00:50:51,589 --> 00:50:49,980
Optical nerves were okay there was

1305
00:50:53,750 --> 00:50:51,599
nothing wrong

1306
00:50:56,329 --> 00:50:53,760
um so neuroscientists had this fantastic

1307
00:50:58,730 --> 00:50:56,339
idea of instrumenting her with an EEG

1308
00:51:00,650 --> 00:50:58,740
cap and measuring her brain activity

1309
00:51:02,690 --> 00:51:00,660
both when the host personality had

1310
00:51:04,609 --> 00:51:02,700
executive control and when one of the

1311
00:51:07,010 --> 00:51:04,619
so-called blind Alters had executive

1312
00:51:08,870 --> 00:51:07,020
control lo and behold when one of those

1313
00:51:10,790 --> 00:51:08,880

altars had executive control the woman

1314

00:51:12,049 --> 00:51:10,800

would have no brain activity in the

1315

00:51:14,089 --> 00:51:12,059

visual cortex

1316

00:51:16,010 --> 00:51:14,099

but when the host personality would be

1317

00:51:18,530 --> 00:51:16,020

back even though that the woman's eyes

1318

00:51:21,410 --> 00:51:18,540

were open so she literally couldn't see

1319

00:51:23,089 --> 00:51:21,420

what was right in front of her eyes with

1320

00:51:24,950 --> 00:51:23,099

nothing physically wrong with her eyes

1321

00:51:27,170 --> 00:51:24,960

Association can do that when the host

1322

00:51:30,470 --> 00:51:27,180

personality would be back in executive

1323

00:51:33,549 --> 00:51:30,480

control there would be normal activity

1324

00:51:36,290 --> 00:51:33,559

in the visual cortex so dissociation

1325

00:51:39,470 --> 00:51:36,300

this is an extreme form of dissociation

1326

00:51:42,589 --> 00:51:39,480

it renders you literally blind to what's

1327

00:51:44,510 --> 00:51:42,599

in front of your open eyes but soft

1328

00:51:45,710 --> 00:51:44,520

forms of dissociation are happening to

1329

00:51:47,930 --> 00:51:45,720

us all the time when you forget

1330

00:51:50,930 --> 00:51:47,940

something that you know you know you're

1331

00:51:53,210 --> 00:51:50,940

dissociated when you park your

1332

00:51:55,609 --> 00:51:53,220

relationship relationship problems to be

1333

00:51:58,309 --> 00:51:55,619

able to go to work and perform

1334

00:52:01,490 --> 00:51:58,319

you are dissociated

1335

00:52:04,010 --> 00:52:01,500

um when you can't remember an old trauma

1336

00:52:07,010 --> 00:52:04,020

you are dissociated

1337

00:52:10,910 --> 00:52:07,020

but dissociation does happen in degrees

1338

00:52:13,190 --> 00:52:10,920

now how what is the actual mechanism how

1339

00:52:15,109 --> 00:52:13,200

can we conceptualize that we are not

1340

00:52:17,210 --> 00:52:15,119

there yet but it obviously has to do

1341

00:52:18,230 --> 00:52:17,220

with inferential isolation which is what

1342

00:52:20,510 --> 00:52:18,240

happens when you can't remember

1343

00:52:22,430 --> 00:52:20,520

something you cannot follow a sort of

1344

00:52:23,750 --> 00:52:22,440

chain of cognitive Association but I

1345

00:52:25,549 --> 00:52:23,760

don't get how this kind of relates to

1346

00:52:28,010 --> 00:52:25,559

idealism I mean I can understand all of

1347

00:52:29,690 --> 00:52:28,020

that in terms of brain function and how

1348

00:52:31,490 --> 00:52:29,700

I mean I don't know the mechanism for

1349

00:52:33,650 --> 00:52:31,500

shutting down V1 but I do know by

1350

00:52:37,250 --> 00:52:33,660

playing around at the edges of sleep and

1351
00:52:40,190 --> 00:52:37,260
so on that I can manipulate whether I'm

1352
00:52:42,349 --> 00:52:40,200
I think whether what what I'm

1353
00:52:46,609 --> 00:52:42,359
experiencing is from V1 or is from from

1354
00:52:48,470 --> 00:52:46,619
a higher imaginary factors and if I

1355
00:52:50,030 --> 00:52:48,480
don't I don't I what I was getting at in

1356
00:52:51,950 --> 00:52:50,040
my question was

1357
00:52:53,809 --> 00:52:51,960
you you've talked about these

1358
00:52:55,490 --> 00:52:53,819
dissociative boundaries as though they

1359
00:52:56,990 --> 00:52:55,500
apply to the whole world not just to one

1360
00:52:58,609 --> 00:52:57,000
human being

1361
00:53:00,770 --> 00:52:58,619
um because the way you were talking was

1362
00:53:04,010 --> 00:53:00,780
like between a person and and the world

1363
00:53:06,170 --> 00:53:04,020

out there and I wondered can you really

1364

00:53:08,329 --> 00:53:06,180

um find these boundaries in

1365

00:53:10,910 --> 00:53:08,339

in the world as you're imagining it made

1366

00:53:12,349 --> 00:53:10,920

entirely of mental stuff what would kind

1367

00:53:14,089 --> 00:53:12,359

of be a minimal

1368

00:53:15,710 --> 00:53:14,099

um dissociative boundary that needs to

1369

00:53:18,230 --> 00:53:15,720

be crossed that's what I don't

1370

00:53:19,849 --> 00:53:18,240

understand about this okay first a brief

1371

00:53:21,589 --> 00:53:19,859

comment to really understand the

1372

00:53:23,690 --> 00:53:21,599

idealism we have to understand it under

1373

00:53:25,190 --> 00:53:23,700

its own terms not under materialist

1374

00:53:27,410 --> 00:53:25,200

terms or assumptions because otherwise

1375

00:53:30,290 --> 00:53:27,420

you'd just

1376

00:53:32,450 --> 00:53:30,300

um I think life okay let me give you

1377

00:53:35,089 --> 00:53:32,460

first another study in 2014 Yolanda

1378

00:53:36,349 --> 00:53:35,099

Chillum here in the Netherlands did the

1379

00:53:37,970 --> 00:53:36,359

study in which she took a group of

1380

00:53:39,950 --> 00:53:37,980

people diagnosed with the dissociative

1381

00:53:43,609 --> 00:53:39,960

identity disorder in a group of actors

1382

00:53:45,470 --> 00:53:43,619

and she put both groups under an fmri to

1383

00:53:48,650 --> 00:53:45,480

see if doctors could objectively

1384

00:53:50,750 --> 00:53:48,660

diagnose a dissociation and the actors

1385

00:53:52,970 --> 00:53:50,760

were asked to pretend to themselves that

1386

00:53:54,890 --> 00:53:52,980

they were dissociated lo and behold you

1387

00:53:57,650 --> 00:53:54,900

can objectively diagnose in other words

1388

00:53:58,670 --> 00:53:57,660

there is something dissociation looks

1389

00:54:03,049 --> 00:53:58,680

like

1390

00:54:05,569 --> 00:54:03,059

identifiable patterns of brain activity

1391

00:54:07,670 --> 00:54:05,579

the association has an extrinsic

1392

00:54:12,470 --> 00:54:07,680

appearance an Outer Image it looks like

1393

00:54:14,809 --> 00:54:12,480

something so my claim is life biology is

1394

00:54:16,430 --> 00:54:14,819

what dissociation at a higher level

1395

00:54:18,230 --> 00:54:16,440

looks like

1396

00:54:20,210 --> 00:54:18,240

and that's why I can't read your

1397

00:54:21,730 --> 00:54:20,220

thoughts for as long as I am alive for

1398

00:54:25,130 --> 00:54:21,740

as long as I look like biology

1399

00:54:27,770 --> 00:54:25,140

metabolism that's what the dissociative

1400

00:54:30,170 --> 00:54:27,780

process in nature is looking like at

1401

00:54:31,970 --> 00:54:30,180

that level just like a person with the

1402

00:54:34,790 --> 00:54:31,980

idea has patterns of brain activity that

1403

00:54:36,349 --> 00:54:34,800

look like something identifiable so

1404

00:54:39,470 --> 00:54:36,359

that's what life is and that's why I

1405

00:54:41,510 --> 00:54:39,480

can't read your thoughts now your inner

1406

00:54:44,030 --> 00:54:41,520

mental processes within the boundaries

1407

00:54:46,549 --> 00:54:44,040

of that of your dissociation

1408

00:54:47,930 --> 00:54:46,559

they have to look like something if they

1409

00:54:50,210 --> 00:54:47,940

are observed from across the

1410

00:54:52,569 --> 00:54:50,220

dissociative boundary and lo and behold

1411

00:54:55,790 --> 00:54:52,579

they look like the neural correlates

1412

00:54:58,010 --> 00:54:55,800

what you're talking about yeah okay

1413

00:55:00,470 --> 00:54:58,020

uh I find this particularly interesting

1414

00:55:02,990 --> 00:55:00,480

when you keep talking about why I can't

1415

00:55:04,609 --> 00:55:03,000

um know your thoughts because I spent

1416

00:55:06,589 --> 00:55:04,619

the first sort of 20 years of my

1417

00:55:08,990 --> 00:55:06,599

research life looking for telepathy and

1418

00:55:11,630 --> 00:55:09,000

Clairvoyance and so on and never finding

1419

00:55:13,549 --> 00:55:11,640

them and it's still of great interest to

1420

00:55:15,950 --> 00:55:13,559

me because I spent a lot of time you

1421

00:55:17,809 --> 00:55:15,960

know if if all the it's all out there in

1422

00:55:19,910 --> 00:55:17,819

the akashic records as the theosophers

1423

00:55:21,290 --> 00:55:19,920

would would have it and all the

1424

00:55:23,690 --> 00:55:21,300

information is there then why can't I

1425

00:55:26,450 --> 00:55:23,700

get it and I had a great Theory

1426

00:55:29,030 --> 00:55:26,460

um when I was doing my PhD uh that

1427

00:55:30,410 --> 00:55:29,040

memory uh the only reason that we

1428

00:55:32,089 --> 00:55:30,420

remember our own thoughts and not

1429

00:55:34,250 --> 00:55:32,099

everybody else's is because they're more

1430

00:55:36,650 --> 00:55:34,260

similar and I I'm still attracted to

1431

00:55:39,290 --> 00:55:36,660

thoughts a lot you know ideas along that

1432

00:55:41,390 --> 00:55:39,300

that kind of stream so that was very

1433

00:55:43,430 --> 00:55:41,400

interesting to me but I'd like to pick

1434

00:55:44,990 --> 00:55:43,440

up on something else you said um because

1435

00:55:49,030 --> 00:55:45,000

you said it sounds absolutely

1436

00:55:51,650 --> 00:55:49,040

extraordinary that this um uh

1437

00:55:54,290 --> 00:55:51,660

person suffering from

1438

00:55:54,890 --> 00:55:54,300

um identity dissociation disorder

1439

00:55:56,750 --> 00:55:54,900

um

1440

00:55:59,030 --> 00:55:56,760

could look at something and not see it

1441

00:56:01,250 --> 00:55:59,040

but we can all look straight at

1442

00:56:02,809 --> 00:56:01,260

something and not see it and we can also

1443

00:56:04,190 --> 00:56:02,819

see something that we haven't looked

1444

00:56:05,390 --> 00:56:04,200

straight at

1445

00:56:07,970 --> 00:56:05,400

um I say this because it's something

1446

00:56:09,890 --> 00:56:07,980

that I often talk about in lectures I I

1447

00:56:12,230 --> 00:56:09,900

was at a conference on psychedelics last

1448

00:56:14,690 --> 00:56:12,240

weekend which was wonderful and I was

1449

00:56:18,049 --> 00:56:14,700

talking about illusionism there

1450

00:56:20,750 --> 00:56:18,059

um and I showed simple demonstrations

1451

00:56:23,390 --> 00:56:20,760

um the the classic one is of course the

1452

00:56:25,010 --> 00:56:23,400

gorillas in our midst video which I'm

1453

00:56:27,170 --> 00:56:25,020

sure you've seen

1454

00:56:29,150 --> 00:56:27,180

um and I won't say more for anyone who

1455

00:56:31,430 --> 00:56:29,160

hasn't seen it to spoil it but you know

1456

00:56:34,250 --> 00:56:31,440

you you you literally must be looking

1457

00:56:37,069 --> 00:56:34,260

straight at The Thing That You Don't See

1458

00:56:39,230 --> 00:56:37,079

but I also do a little trick which is

1459

00:56:42,349 --> 00:56:39,240

does the opposite thing

1460

00:56:45,530 --> 00:56:42,359

um in uh Consciousness explained

1461

00:56:47,690 --> 00:56:45,540

um Dan talked about a room papered

1462

00:56:49,250 --> 00:56:47,700

entirely with identical portraits of

1463

00:56:51,049 --> 00:56:49,260

Marilyn Monroe

1464

00:56:53,750 --> 00:56:51,059

um I just made up a picture of identical

1465

00:56:57,890 --> 00:56:53,760

portraits of Dan Dennis and there's 18

1466

00:56:59,809 --> 00:56:57,900

in this picture and uh you know how many

1467

00:57:01,849 --> 00:56:59,819

circades you can make in a second

1468

00:57:04,309 --> 00:57:01,859

probably five or six or something like

1469

00:57:05,990 --> 00:57:04,319

that and if you just show the picture to

1470

00:57:07,430 --> 00:57:06,000

people for two seconds you know they

1471

00:57:09,829 --> 00:57:07,440

cannot have looked at all the pictures

1472

00:57:13,190 --> 00:57:09,839

and yet what when you ask them what they

1473

00:57:15,349 --> 00:57:13,200

saw they say I saw 18 identical pictures

1474

00:57:17,030 --> 00:57:15,359

of dandeni and one with horns and a scar

1475

00:57:19,069 --> 00:57:17,040

so we've got one with haunts and a scar

1476

00:57:21,950 --> 00:57:19,079

on it and um

1477

00:57:23,450 --> 00:57:21,960

so then I can explain how you're using

1478

00:57:26,569 --> 00:57:23,460

texture detection straight line

1479

00:57:28,490 --> 00:57:26,579

detection all sorts of shortcuts to say

1480

00:57:30,349 --> 00:57:28,500

oh all those pictures are the same you

1481

00:57:32,690 --> 00:57:30,359

don't need to look at them all in order

1482

00:57:36,049 --> 00:57:32,700

to come to the conclusion and that

1483

00:57:38,690 --> 00:57:36,059

conclusion is what you see it's not what

1484

00:57:40,670 --> 00:57:38,700

went in your eyes it's what you will

1485

00:57:43,309 --> 00:57:40,680

report later that you saw

1486

00:57:44,870 --> 00:57:43,319

so it dissociates um you know you can

1487

00:57:46,609 --> 00:57:44,880

you can see what you haven't looked at

1488

00:57:49,309 --> 00:57:46,619

and you can look at what you haven't

1489

00:57:50,690 --> 00:57:49,319

seen this doesn't help with idealism and

1490

00:57:53,089 --> 00:57:50,700

all of that but I thought it's kind of

1491

00:57:56,089 --> 00:57:53,099

relevant too yeah you're making that it

1492

00:57:58,190 --> 00:57:56,099

is it it is I mean blindsight is a super

1493

00:58:00,430 --> 00:57:58,200

curious phenomenon as well there is a

1494

00:58:03,049 --> 00:58:00,440

paper by there are people

1495

00:58:05,150 --> 00:58:03,059

published in 2002

1496

00:58:06,589 --> 00:58:05,160

forgot the name of the altar I know him

1497

00:58:08,390 --> 00:58:06,599

personally it's because I take

1498

00:58:11,089 --> 00:58:08,400

amitriptyline for my tinnitus sometimes

1499

00:58:12,950 --> 00:58:11,099

I forget stuff we all love that stuff

1500

00:58:14,210 --> 00:58:12,960

it's a relief when someone else does go

1501
00:58:16,730 --> 00:58:14,220
on

1502
00:58:18,950 --> 00:58:16,740
I remember the the paper was called

1503
00:58:20,450 --> 00:58:18,960
dissociations between Consciousness and

1504
00:58:22,370 --> 00:58:20,460
matter Consciousness or something like

1505
00:58:24,049 --> 00:58:22,380
this so there are multiple mechanisms

1506
00:58:26,329 --> 00:58:24,059
involved

1507
00:58:29,089 --> 00:58:26,339
um in the case you you refer to that you

1508
00:58:31,370 --> 00:58:29,099
don't see the gorilla I bet that if you

1509
00:58:33,290 --> 00:58:31,380
had been instrumented with an EEG cap

1510
00:58:35,510 --> 00:58:33,300
although you don't report seeing the

1511
00:58:37,849 --> 00:58:35,520
gorilla there would be a visual cortex

1512
00:58:39,770 --> 00:58:37,859
activity so it's not the same as what

1513
00:58:42,289 --> 00:58:39,780

this German guys did with the woman with

1514

00:58:44,630 --> 00:58:42,299

the dissociative identity disorder but

1515

00:58:47,510 --> 00:58:44,640

it does reflect an important distinction

1516

00:58:49,549 --> 00:58:47,520

that we often don't make even in

1517

00:58:51,589 --> 00:58:49,559

academic discourse which is the

1518

00:58:54,049 --> 00:58:51,599

difference between phenomenal States

1519

00:58:54,829 --> 00:58:54,059

pure and simple experiences pure and

1520

00:58:57,530 --> 00:58:54,839

simple

1521

00:58:59,930 --> 00:58:57,540

and metacognitive phenomenal States

1522

00:59:02,210 --> 00:58:59,940

those require something more those

1523

00:59:05,630 --> 00:59:02,220

require not only the experience

1524

00:59:07,789 --> 00:59:05,640

but the explicit knowing that you are

1525

00:59:10,010 --> 00:59:07,799

having the experience and that's a

1526

00:59:12,410 --> 00:59:10,020

product of attention you need to attend

1527

00:59:14,450 --> 00:59:12,420

to become metacognitive of an experience

1528

00:59:16,849 --> 00:59:14,460

for instance we are always experiencing

1529

00:59:19,130 --> 00:59:16,859

our breathing now the inflation and

1530

00:59:22,130 --> 00:59:19,140

deflation of our rib cage the airflow in

1531

00:59:25,069 --> 00:59:22,140

our nafters but we are most of the time

1532

00:59:27,349 --> 00:59:25,079

not matter conscious of our breathing

1533

00:59:29,030 --> 00:59:27,359

because we don't put our attention there

1534

00:59:33,770 --> 00:59:29,040

we don't bring it under the focus of

1535

00:59:37,130 --> 00:59:33,780

attention so um the the Curious Thing is

1536

00:59:39,109 --> 00:59:37,140

that there can be almost permanent

1537

00:59:42,349 --> 00:59:39,119

dissociations between experience and

1538

00:59:45,170 --> 00:59:42,359

matter experience like Blindsight where

1539

00:59:47,030 --> 00:59:45,180

people act as and react as though they

1540

00:59:50,390 --> 00:59:47,040

see something but they can't report it

1541

00:59:53,030 --> 00:59:50,400

and what I'm trying to drive to is that

1542

00:59:55,549 --> 00:59:53,040

there is never such a thing as states

1543

00:59:58,190 --> 00:59:55,559

that are not phenomenal there is never

1544

01:00:00,470 --> 00:59:58,200

such a thing as strictly unconscious

1545

01:00:02,270 --> 01:00:00,480

States even if you go back to the

1546

01:00:05,270 --> 01:00:02,280

history of psychology and how the word

1547

01:00:08,329 --> 01:00:05,280

unconsciousness came from Young Freud

1548

01:00:10,190 --> 01:00:08,339

and bsna and all the others what they

1549

01:00:11,809 --> 01:00:10,200

are describing and it's very clear when

1550

01:00:14,329 --> 01:00:11,819

you read their texts what they are

1551
01:00:16,309 --> 01:00:14,339
describing is meta consciousness they

1552
01:00:17,990 --> 01:00:16,319
are not describing experience they are

1553
01:00:20,210 --> 01:00:18,000
describing knowledge explicit

1554
01:00:23,150 --> 01:00:20,220
introspective knowledge of the

1555
01:00:26,809 --> 01:00:23,160
experience so what this tells us is that

1556
01:00:29,809 --> 01:00:26,819
we may never actually be unconscious we

1557
01:00:32,990 --> 01:00:29,819
know now that if you undergo syncope if

1558
01:00:34,910 --> 01:00:33,000
you pass out people report amazing stuff

1559
01:00:37,250 --> 01:00:34,920
During the period in which they were

1560
01:00:39,589 --> 01:00:37,260
understanding you talked about us being

1561
01:00:43,670 --> 01:00:39,599
conscious and that involves a self who

1562
01:00:45,410 --> 01:00:43,680
is so I can get the idea that the uh

1563
01:00:47,870 --> 01:00:45,420

these things that we call unconscious

1564

01:00:50,390 --> 01:00:47,880

are in some sense mental and then the

1565

01:00:53,390 --> 01:00:50,400

metacognitive is is is added on onto

1566

01:00:56,750 --> 01:00:53,400

that but that usually involves the the

1567

01:00:58,789 --> 01:00:56,760

feeling that I am now paying attention

1568

01:01:00,650 --> 01:00:58,799

to this and I am so on so it's all part

1569

01:01:02,210 --> 01:01:00,660

of the illusion so you could say that

1570

01:01:04,430 --> 01:01:02,220

illusionism at least in the way I'm

1571

01:01:07,390 --> 01:01:04,440

thinking of it is that all that

1572

01:01:11,210 --> 01:01:07,400

metacognitive stuff is is is

1573

01:01:14,569 --> 01:01:11,220

speculations that are untrue and

1574

01:01:17,150 --> 01:01:14,579

underlying that I don't know I it's just

1575

01:01:18,829 --> 01:01:17,160

you as a proper philosopher who have

1576

01:01:20,809 --> 01:01:18,839

thought through all this this idealism

1577

01:01:22,490 --> 01:01:20,819

stuff and you can talk about it

1578

01:01:24,829 --> 01:01:22,500

coherently I'm only getting as far as

1579

01:01:26,870 --> 01:01:24,839

saying all this stuff's wrong but what

1580

01:01:29,210 --> 01:01:26,880

is there when there's a processes going

1581

01:01:31,549 --> 01:01:29,220

on there's responses going on and

1582

01:01:32,809 --> 01:01:31,559

there's not somebody going ah this is

1583

01:01:35,390 --> 01:01:32,819

what I'm

1584

01:01:37,549 --> 01:01:35,400

um you know I'm doing this now that's

1585

01:01:40,490 --> 01:01:37,559

where the illusion comes in thinking

1586

01:01:42,890 --> 01:01:40,500

that what we have to explain is that not

1587

01:01:45,710 --> 01:01:42,900

we have to explain the whole underlying

1588

01:01:47,569 --> 01:01:45,720

thing and I come back again to personal

1589

01:01:48,890 --> 01:01:47,579

experience

1590

01:01:50,829 --> 01:01:48,900

um I tend not to call it introspection

1591

01:01:53,329 --> 01:01:50,839

because that has such historical

1592

01:01:55,190 --> 01:01:53,339

problems associated with it but that

1593

01:01:57,829 --> 01:01:55,200

that's what you call it and it's fair

1594

01:02:00,049 --> 01:01:57,839

enough all different kinds mindfulness

1595

01:02:03,230 --> 01:02:00,059

is a real nightmare because there's so

1596

01:02:05,270 --> 01:02:03,240

many different forms of it but one from

1597

01:02:07,910 --> 01:02:05,280

I've done a lot of practice intensive

1598

01:02:10,190 --> 01:02:07,920

practice of mindfulness in ordinary life

1599

01:02:12,289 --> 01:02:10,200

and what can happen is their whole

1600

01:02:16,130 --> 01:02:12,299

metacognitive thing disappears

1601
01:02:17,990 --> 01:02:16,140
and you there's there's stuff happening

1602
01:02:19,430 --> 01:02:18,000
um now if you're an ordinary life you

1603
01:02:21,470 --> 01:02:19,440
can't let go completely of the

1604
01:02:23,329 --> 01:02:21,480
metacognitive stuff you have to have

1605
01:02:25,250 --> 01:02:23,339
some kind of awareness of I'm walking

1606
01:02:28,849 --> 01:02:25,260
along here and whatever

1607
01:02:31,370 --> 01:02:28,859
um but in meditation you can let go of

1608
01:02:32,930 --> 01:02:31,380
it completely and then there seems to be

1609
01:02:35,210 --> 01:02:32,940
this is just I'm talking from personal

1610
01:02:38,030 --> 01:02:35,220
experience here in certain kinds of deep

1611
01:02:39,589 --> 01:02:38,040
meditation particularly on Retreat there

1612
01:02:42,049 --> 01:02:39,599
can be a sense in which there's stuff

1613
01:02:44,630 --> 01:02:42,059

happening but it's not happening to

1614

01:02:46,609 --> 01:02:44,640

anybody and it's not even happening in

1615

01:02:47,630 --> 01:02:46,619

time or space it's kind of lost all

1616

01:02:50,030 --> 01:02:47,640

those things

1617

01:02:51,650 --> 01:02:50,040

there's where I kind of go to try to

1618

01:02:53,809 --> 01:02:51,660

understand things and I don't get very

1619

01:02:55,549 --> 01:02:53,819

far and maybe and what you've been

1620

01:02:57,770 --> 01:02:55,559

telling me today I've got well not maybe

1621

01:02:59,690 --> 01:02:57,780

I have got more possible ways of

1622

01:03:02,390 --> 01:02:59,700

thinking about it

1623

01:03:04,549 --> 01:03:02,400

um I I'm not um completely buying it

1624

01:03:07,549 --> 01:03:04,559

because I don't understand you well

1625

01:03:08,930 --> 01:03:07,559

enough but I think we actually have some

1626

01:03:12,410 --> 01:03:08,940

commonality

1627

01:03:13,910 --> 01:03:12,420

in what I've just said there well by the

1628

01:03:16,190 --> 01:03:13,920

way I just remembered the name I had

1629

01:03:19,430 --> 01:03:16,200

forgotten Jonathan's cooler everybody

1630

01:03:20,990 --> 01:03:19,440

should know his name yeah so he

1631

01:03:23,089 --> 01:03:21,000

published this dissociations between

1632

01:03:25,190 --> 01:03:23,099

awareness and meta awareness back in

1633

01:03:27,410 --> 01:03:25,200

2002 a fantastic paper that I think

1634

01:03:28,970 --> 01:03:27,420

everybody should read I'm going to write

1635

01:03:30,589 --> 01:03:28,980

that out I'm doing something with him in

1636

01:03:31,789 --> 01:03:30,599

in the near future so that will be a

1637

01:03:32,470 --> 01:03:31,799

good thing

1638

01:03:34,789 --> 01:03:32,480

um

1639

01:03:36,289 --> 01:03:34,799

associations between Consciousness and

1640

01:03:37,069 --> 01:03:36,299

meta-consciousness or something like

1641

01:03:39,410 --> 01:03:37,079

this

1642

01:03:42,049 --> 01:03:39,420

2002.

1643

01:03:43,609 --> 01:03:42,059

um got it thank you

1644

01:03:47,750 --> 01:03:43,619

I

1645

01:03:49,970 --> 01:03:47,760

don't totally go along with your use of

1646

01:03:51,349 --> 01:03:49,980

the word illusionism and and I I don't

1647

01:03:52,730 --> 01:03:51,359

blame you for that or anything but I'm

1648

01:03:55,849 --> 01:03:52,740

not comfortable with it and the reason

1649

01:03:57,770 --> 01:03:55,859

is the following defined so

1650

01:03:59,750 --> 01:03:57,780

vaguely

1651

01:04:02,930 --> 01:03:59,760

the history of science is the history of

1652

01:04:04,430 --> 01:04:02,940

Illusion because hardly anything is what

1653

01:04:05,829 --> 01:04:04,440

it seems to be

1654

01:04:08,329 --> 01:04:05,839

I mean

1655

01:04:11,630 --> 01:04:08,339

you see the whole history of science is

1656

01:04:13,970 --> 01:04:11,640

a testament to that so if the word is so

1657

01:04:16,609 --> 01:04:13,980

broad that it encompasses so much it

1658

01:04:18,829 --> 01:04:16,619

becomes a useless word because we can't

1659

01:04:22,670 --> 01:04:18,839

specify something out of the background

1660

01:04:25,309 --> 01:04:22,680

uh by using it but don't forget all I'm

1661

01:04:27,829 --> 01:04:25,319

saying is consciousness is an illusion

1662

01:04:29,510 --> 01:04:27,839

and by that I guess what I mean is the

1663

01:04:31,069 --> 01:04:29,520

way people talk about Consciousness the

1664

01:04:32,930 --> 01:04:31,079

theories they build about Consciousness

1665

01:04:34,730 --> 01:04:32,940

the whole idea that Consciousness is

1666

01:04:38,270 --> 01:04:34,740

there's such a thing as Consciousness

1667

01:04:40,849 --> 01:04:38,280

itself which can be separated from you

1668

01:04:43,609 --> 01:04:40,859

know matter from unconscious States and

1669

01:04:44,930 --> 01:04:43,619

so on all of that's the problem I'm not

1670

01:04:46,910 --> 01:04:44,940

trying to say

1671

01:04:49,069 --> 01:04:46,920

um anything about the outside world on

1672

01:04:52,010 --> 01:04:49,079

physics and so on as being illusory I'm

1673

01:04:54,589 --> 01:04:52,020

simply talking about people's Concepts

1674

01:04:55,270 --> 01:04:54,599

matter whatever

1675

01:04:57,710 --> 01:04:55,280

um

1676

01:05:00,230 --> 01:04:57,720

Concepts about the nature of their own

1677

01:05:02,329 --> 01:05:00,240

minds and if you can clear away that

1678

01:05:04,690 --> 01:05:02,339

problem whether you do it by personal

1679

01:05:08,030 --> 01:05:04,700

practice or by some kind of theorizing

1680

01:05:10,309 --> 01:05:08,040

then I think we might be making progress

1681

01:05:12,890 --> 01:05:10,319

that's as far as I go really which is

1682

01:05:14,750 --> 01:05:12,900

pathetic I mean I you know I

1683

01:05:16,250 --> 01:05:14,760

I I would I don't blame you in the least

1684

01:05:17,930 --> 01:05:16,260

for saying well you know it's so it's

1685

01:05:19,490 --> 01:05:17,940

too vague and so on but I just feel it

1686

01:05:22,250 --> 01:05:19,500

it has to be done because I get so

1687

01:05:25,690 --> 01:05:22,260

frustrated with the theorists and the

1688

01:05:27,950 --> 01:05:25,700

experimenters and so on who constantly

1689

01:05:31,190 --> 01:05:27,960

refer to Consciousness as though it's

1690

01:05:33,470 --> 01:05:31,200

something produced by the brain and

1691

01:05:35,750 --> 01:05:33,480

that's the heart of what I'm trying to

1692

01:05:37,190 --> 01:05:35,760

get away with if that helps at all I

1693

01:05:38,750 --> 01:05:37,200

sympathize

1694

01:05:41,809 --> 01:05:38,760

um completely so I don't like the word

1695

01:05:43,490 --> 01:05:41,819

but I sympathize with it I I'll give

1696

01:05:45,770 --> 01:05:43,500

you by the way I don't believe in a

1697

01:05:48,230 --> 01:05:45,780

personal self it's just not there it's a

1698

01:05:50,930 --> 01:05:48,240

narrative in a subject so every time I

1699

01:05:52,910 --> 01:05:50,940

say I I'm forced to say this by the

1700

01:05:54,589 --> 01:05:52,920

English language there are languages

1701

01:05:58,309 --> 01:05:54,599

that don't have that particular pronoun

1702

01:06:00,470 --> 01:05:58,319

but I don't speak them so I'm forced to

1703

01:06:02,089 --> 01:06:00,480

say which language Which languages uh

1704

01:06:04,910 --> 01:06:02,099

it's on some

1705

01:06:06,650 --> 01:06:04,920

it doesn't even have a written form I

1706

01:06:08,510 --> 01:06:06,660

think it's um we would call them

1707

01:06:10,609 --> 01:06:08,520

primitive languages although I hate this

1708

01:06:12,710 --> 01:06:10,619

word I think it's an inappropriate word

1709

01:06:15,770 --> 01:06:12,720

but there are languages in which there

1710

01:06:17,870 --> 01:06:15,780

is no first person pronoun so there are

1711

01:06:20,329 --> 01:06:17,880

some others in a simpler way which which

1712

01:06:22,190 --> 01:06:20,339

although they kind of infer it I mean I

1713

01:06:24,049 --> 01:06:22,200

I tried to learn polish once because my

1714

01:06:25,910 --> 01:06:24,059

first husband was polish and there isn't

1715

01:06:28,130 --> 01:06:25,920

they don't use the word iron in the same

1716

01:06:29,990 --> 01:06:28,140

heavy way that English uses it all the

1717

01:06:31,609 --> 01:06:30,000

time it's very often incorporated into

1718

01:06:33,549 --> 01:06:31,619

other words or it's such a long time ago

1719

01:06:36,770 --> 01:06:33,559

that I tried to learn it

1720

01:06:38,450 --> 01:06:36,780

now but but like your point I guess is

1721

01:06:40,609 --> 01:06:38,460

is just to say

1722

01:06:43,609 --> 01:06:40,619

languages that were different um

1723

01:06:44,930 --> 01:06:43,619

solidity to the concept of self and of

1724

01:06:46,549 --> 01:06:44,940

course you and I have exactly the same

1725

01:06:47,990 --> 01:06:46,559

problem talking to people who haven't

1726

01:06:50,329 --> 01:06:48,000

thought about this stuff because we have

1727

01:06:51,710 --> 01:06:50,339

to say well what I think illusionism is

1728

01:06:55,309 --> 01:06:51,720

the best theory well who's the thing

1729

01:06:56,870 --> 01:06:55,319

who's thinking in there no but to go

1730

01:06:59,089 --> 01:06:56,880

back to the point that you raised um

1731

01:06:59,890 --> 01:06:59,099

I'll give you an example of a problem I

1732

01:07:04,910 --> 01:06:59,900

face

1733

01:07:07,250 --> 01:07:04,920

regarding people people's very loose use

1734

01:07:09,589 --> 01:07:07,260

of words like mind Consciousness and

1735

01:07:12,410 --> 01:07:09,599

matter and other prejudices that are

1736

01:07:13,549 --> 01:07:12,420

unexamined uh and and go into that so

1737

01:07:14,450 --> 01:07:13,559

people don't even know what they're

1738

01:07:16,130 --> 01:07:14,460

thinking they don't know what

1739

01:07:19,930 --> 01:07:16,140

assumptions they're making so to give

1740

01:07:22,490 --> 01:07:19,940

you a concrete example I am often

1741

01:07:25,069 --> 01:07:22,500

faced with the falling so-called

1742

01:07:27,410 --> 01:07:25,079

refutation of idealism it goes as

1743

01:07:29,809 --> 01:07:27,420

follows well Bernardo you say you say

1744

01:07:32,329 --> 01:07:29,819

that everything is mental so everything

1745

01:07:34,250 --> 01:07:32,339

has to be efficacious insofar and it is

1746

01:07:36,529 --> 01:07:34,260

mental only mental states are causally

1747

01:07:38,630 --> 01:07:36,539

efficacious but I can give you an

1748

01:07:41,450 --> 01:07:38,640

example that it's not the case look if

1749

01:07:43,430 --> 01:07:41,460

you give me your arm and your arm and I

1750

01:07:45,770 --> 01:07:43,440

stick a needle in it that's a very

1751

01:07:47,450 --> 01:07:45,780

physical thing and you will move your

1752

01:07:49,609 --> 01:07:47,460

arm you will register paying and you

1753

01:07:51,589 --> 01:07:49,619

will move your arm or we don't need to

1754

01:07:54,069 --> 01:07:51,599

go that far what if I punch you in the

1755

01:07:57,170 --> 01:07:54,079

face or if you drink a bottle of wine

1756

01:07:59,569 --> 01:07:57,180

this very physical thing has a causal

1757

01:08:01,789 --> 01:07:59,579

effect on mental inner states Ergo

1758

01:08:04,370 --> 01:08:01,799

idealism is false

1759

01:08:07,730 --> 01:08:04,380

now you see the problem there for the

1760

01:08:10,430 --> 01:08:07,740

idealist there are no such things as

1761

01:08:13,250 --> 01:08:10,440

physical States outside mind all

1762

01:08:16,010 --> 01:08:13,260

material things are representations of

1763

01:08:19,249 --> 01:08:16,020

mental States so that needle going into

1764

01:08:21,050 --> 01:08:19,259

my arm is a dashboard representation of

1765

01:08:24,050 --> 01:08:21,060

a mental process interfering with

1766

01:08:26,510 --> 01:08:24,060

another across its dissociative boundary

1767

01:08:29,630 --> 01:08:26,520

that glass that bottle of wine that I

1768

01:08:32,689 --> 01:08:29,640

drink that's an icon on on my dashboard

1769

01:08:35,689 --> 01:08:32,699

that represents a transpersonal mental

1770

01:08:38,630 --> 01:08:35,699

state that I am bringing into my

1771

01:08:39,910 --> 01:08:38,640

dissociative boundary by ingesting it so

1772

01:08:43,430 --> 01:08:39,920

there is no

1773

01:08:45,229 --> 01:08:43,440

a bottle of wine as a material thing the

1774

01:08:46,970 --> 01:08:45,239

bottle wine the bottle of wine is a

1775

01:08:49,550 --> 01:08:46,980

representation of a mental state only

1776

01:08:51,289 --> 01:08:49,560

mental states are causal but it's very

1777

01:08:54,229 --> 01:08:51,299

difficult for people to make this switch

1778

01:08:57,229 --> 01:08:54,239

from dualism dualism seems to be so

1779

01:08:59,209 --> 01:08:57,239

bloody ingrained in language in our

1780

01:09:01,729 --> 01:08:59,219

logical assumptions in how we see

1781

01:09:03,829 --> 01:09:01,739

everything that people just even when

1782

01:09:04,970 --> 01:09:03,839

they think even when they agree with

1783

01:09:11,329 --> 01:09:04,980

idealism

1784

01:09:13,870 --> 01:09:11,339

often see this in in courses I give that

1785

01:09:17,150 --> 01:09:13,880

even the idealists they fall for this

1786

01:09:19,430 --> 01:09:17,160

constantly so yeah that's an illusion

1787

01:09:22,669 --> 01:09:19,440

it's an illusion that there are no

1788

01:09:25,430 --> 01:09:22,679

mental States so from that perspective I

1789

01:09:26,269 --> 01:09:25,440

agree I am with you but I don't think

1790

01:09:28,610 --> 01:09:26,279

it's

1791

01:09:31,610 --> 01:09:28,620

I I don't want to keep on existing on

1792

01:09:34,130 --> 01:09:31,620

this but I prefer to to say specifically

1793

01:09:36,590 --> 01:09:34,140

what I mean like I just did yeah and to

1794

01:09:39,070 --> 01:09:36,600

just say illusionism yeah you see what I

1795

01:09:41,450 --> 01:09:39,080

mean yeah yeah

1796

01:09:44,809 --> 01:09:41,460

but you're making me think there

1797

01:09:48,470 --> 01:09:44,819

something quite uncomfortable so you've

1798

01:09:51,110 --> 01:09:48,480

got the let's say the drug that affects

1799

01:09:54,229 --> 01:09:51,120

the brain or the pin that goes in my arm

1800

01:09:58,610 --> 01:09:54,239

so the pin and the all those processes

1801
01:10:00,470 --> 01:09:58,620
are mental inequality and then hear me

1802
01:10:02,930 --> 01:10:00,480
out on this one I'm struggling to get it

1803
01:10:05,090 --> 01:10:02,940
clear but I'm then constantly asking

1804
01:10:07,310 --> 01:10:05,100
myself well why are the regularities

1805
01:10:09,950 --> 01:10:07,320
that are why does that does that happen

1806
01:10:13,189 --> 01:10:09,960
why are there as it were laws of nature

1807
01:10:15,350 --> 01:10:13,199
that make uh that you know the the

1808
01:10:17,630 --> 01:10:15,360
liquid run along there and all of those

1809
01:10:21,229 --> 01:10:17,640
things well then I realize

1810
01:10:24,470 --> 01:10:21,239
that as far as I know physics also can't

1811
01:10:26,510 --> 01:10:24,480
answer that question because if you ask

1812
01:10:29,630 --> 01:10:26,520
something like well why is Planck's

1813
01:10:31,669 --> 01:10:29,640

constant what it is or why is

1814

01:10:33,950 --> 01:10:31,679

um at the speed of light what it is I

1815

01:10:38,209 --> 01:10:33,960

don't think their answers are there

1816

01:10:43,970 --> 01:10:38,219

um so perhaps uh it's unfair to ask the

1817

01:10:47,090 --> 01:10:43,980

the um idealist uh to explain why the

1818

01:10:49,610 --> 01:10:47,100

mental properties of the world give rise

1819

01:10:52,729 --> 01:10:49,620

to or are

1820

01:10:55,130 --> 01:10:52,739

capable of trees and sky and all the

1821

01:10:58,070 --> 01:10:55,140

other things

1822

01:10:59,270 --> 01:10:58,080

the answer would be to be is to have

1823

01:11:04,250 --> 01:10:59,280

properties

1824

01:11:05,930 --> 01:11:04,260

and therefore it behaves the way it does

1825

01:11:07,250 --> 01:11:05,940

because it is what it is instead of

1826

01:11:09,410 --> 01:11:07,260

something else

1827

01:11:13,330 --> 01:11:09,420

nature is what it is so it does what it

1828

01:11:17,090 --> 01:11:13,340

does it's not something else

1829

01:11:21,110 --> 01:11:17,100

the self that I could imagine that is uh

1830

01:11:23,630 --> 01:11:21,120

the author inside of these words and has

1831

01:11:27,050 --> 01:11:23,640

Free Will and all of that

1832

01:11:28,750 --> 01:11:27,060

would you say that it is what it is

1833

01:11:32,750 --> 01:11:28,760

because

1834

01:11:34,910 --> 01:11:32,760

okay I think nature is what it is and

1835

01:11:37,430 --> 01:11:34,920

the illusion of a personal self is a

1836

01:11:39,169 --> 01:11:37,440

behavior of nature

1837

01:11:42,110 --> 01:11:39,179

in other words it's a narrative behavior

1838

01:11:43,310 --> 01:11:42,120

of Nature and so I want to ask why it

1839

01:11:46,810 --> 01:11:43,320

throws up

1840

01:11:50,390 --> 01:11:46,820

this self all the time I mean in English

1841

01:11:52,550 --> 01:11:50,400

view you can sort of say well the the

1842

01:11:54,290 --> 01:11:52,560

system needs a representation of its own

1843

01:11:55,910 --> 01:11:54,300

capabilities and so it builds such a

1844

01:11:58,490 --> 01:11:55,920

representation and there it is and then

1845

01:12:01,070 --> 01:11:58,500

you can't say why it feels like anything

1846

01:12:03,709 --> 01:12:01,080

because materialism can't

1847

01:12:05,510 --> 01:12:03,719

um well does idealism really do better

1848

01:12:07,310 --> 01:12:05,520

on that

1849

01:12:09,709 --> 01:12:07,320

yeah you're asking pretty pretty

1850

01:12:11,450 --> 01:12:09,719

fundamental science uh philosophy of

1851

01:12:13,550 --> 01:12:11,460

science questions that they apply to any

1852

01:12:16,850 --> 01:12:13,560

metaphysics not only idealism I think

1853

01:12:19,189 --> 01:12:16,860

but uh but I'll try to answer

1854

01:12:20,990 --> 01:12:19,199

there is some use to the fiction of the

1855

01:12:23,209 --> 01:12:21,000

personal self you need to know to which

1856

01:12:27,229 --> 01:12:23,219

mouth to bring the fork

1857

01:12:28,490 --> 01:12:27,239

otherwise you starve so the the ego is a

1858

01:12:30,770 --> 01:12:28,500

useful tool

1859

01:12:32,570 --> 01:12:30,780

so hang on any animal will eat without

1860

01:12:35,030 --> 01:12:32,580

having I don't think that my cat has

1861

01:12:37,850 --> 01:12:35,040

much of a personal self but it is they

1862

01:12:40,130 --> 01:12:37,860

have a body schema too yeah indeed and

1863

01:12:42,229 --> 01:12:40,140

an attention schemer I imagine what they

1864

01:12:44,570 --> 01:12:42,239

don't have is matter cognition well now

1865

01:12:47,810 --> 01:12:44,580

metacognition is when the subject sort

1866

01:12:49,910 --> 01:12:47,820

of abstracts itself away from its own

1867

01:12:52,130 --> 01:12:49,920

experiential content

1868

01:12:55,130 --> 01:12:52,140

and that's why we say

1869

01:12:57,530 --> 01:12:55,140

I feel pain or I have hunger

1870

01:13:02,209 --> 01:12:57,540

because without metacognition we would

1871

01:13:04,790 --> 01:13:02,219

say I am pain I am hunger because the

1872

01:13:06,290 --> 01:13:04,800

being of the subject is its state and

1873

01:13:09,830 --> 01:13:06,300

the state of the subject is the

1874

01:13:11,990 --> 01:13:09,840

experience that it's quote undergoing so

1875

01:13:15,470 --> 01:13:12,000

the moment we say I have pain

1876

01:13:17,689 --> 01:13:15,480

or I will go there or I feel this way

1877

01:13:20,990 --> 01:13:17,699

that that's already a body schema with

1878

01:13:23,030 --> 01:13:21,000

metacognition on top so a metacognized

1879

01:13:26,030 --> 01:13:23,040

subjects separate from the rest of the

1880

01:13:28,250 --> 01:13:26,040

world is there a use to this I'm sure

1881

01:13:30,169 --> 01:13:28,260

there is a use to this so it's a it's a

1882

01:13:31,310 --> 01:13:30,179

very easy well I've put forward a

1883

01:13:32,870 --> 01:13:31,320

different Theory this I won't go into

1884

01:13:34,790 --> 01:13:32,880

now but Kurt probably knows something

1885

01:13:36,770 --> 01:13:34,800

about it that it's actually a product of

1886

01:13:39,169 --> 01:13:36,780

magnetic Evolution it's the force of

1887

01:13:40,910 --> 01:13:39,179

memes particularly words that get on

1888

01:13:43,189 --> 01:13:40,920

better when they're associated with the

1889

01:13:45,709 --> 01:13:43,199

I word and that our culture is

1890

01:13:47,510 --> 01:13:45,719

constantly um backing up this idea of

1891

01:13:53,530 --> 01:13:47,520

itself and making it bigger and bigger

1892

01:13:59,330 --> 01:13:55,669

says he wants to talk about some other

1893

01:14:01,729 --> 01:13:59,340

time I do feel that I understand a lot

1894

01:14:03,950 --> 01:14:01,739

better now so I rather enjoyed this

1895

01:14:05,689 --> 01:14:03,960

conversation even though I find it quite

1896

01:14:08,030 --> 01:14:05,699

stressful and difficult trying to get my

1897

01:14:10,070 --> 01:14:08,040

head around it and say something vaguely

1898

01:14:12,110 --> 01:14:10,080

intelligent in response

1899

01:14:21,890 --> 01:14:12,120

um but thank you very much for

1900

01:14:27,229 --> 01:14:25,430

advance in in understanding something

1901

01:14:29,390 --> 01:14:27,239

that you were not familiar with before

1902

01:14:31,610 --> 01:14:29,400

so could this to you for that I don't

1903

01:14:35,830 --> 01:14:31,620

know whether I would be able to make

1904

01:14:39,470 --> 01:14:35,840

this advance so quickly it took my ears

1905

01:14:41,030 --> 01:14:39,480

pardon it took me years of course of

1906

01:14:43,070 --> 01:14:41,040

course but then I've been worrying about

1907

01:14:45,470 --> 01:14:43,080

Consciousness for years so you know

1908

01:14:46,850 --> 01:14:45,480

that's why you said so many things that

1909

01:14:49,370 --> 01:14:46,860

sparked off things I've thought about

1910

01:14:51,470 --> 01:14:49,380

over all these many many years when I've

1911

01:14:53,270 --> 01:14:51,480

been obsessed with Consciousness

1912

01:14:54,950 --> 01:14:53,280

um I haven't thought about them in in

1913

01:14:57,410 --> 01:14:54,960

the exact way that you are but I've

1914

01:15:01,130 --> 01:14:57,420

thought about them enough at least to

1915

01:15:02,270 --> 01:15:01,140

recognize engage with it you know yeah

1916

01:15:05,750 --> 01:15:02,280

well

1917

01:15:08,149 --> 01:15:05,760

know us too but Bernardo knows that I

1918

01:15:10,250 --> 01:15:08,159

consider a theologian a success when I

1919

01:15:12,770 --> 01:15:10,260

could effectively have popcorn here and

1920

01:15:14,870 --> 01:15:12,780

just watch and watch yeah yeah because

1921

01:15:16,790 --> 01:15:14,880

it means that you both are from what I

1922

01:15:18,290 --> 01:15:16,800

saw trying to understand one another's

1923

01:15:20,149 --> 01:15:18,300

point of view rather than trying to

1924

01:15:21,229 --> 01:15:20,159

understand in order to debate you're

1925

01:15:23,510 --> 01:15:21,239

trying to understand because you're

1926

01:15:25,729 --> 01:15:23,520

curious so if I could summarize it went

1927

01:15:27,410 --> 01:15:25,739

something like initially Sue you're

1928

01:15:29,270 --> 01:15:27,420

saying look this is I'm an Illusionist

1929

01:15:31,010 --> 01:15:29,280

and then bernardo's saying well firstly

1930

01:15:33,169 --> 01:15:31,020

that's not what I understand illusionism

1931

01:15:35,209 --> 01:15:33,179

to be there are several others so that's

1932

01:15:37,550 --> 01:15:35,219

different secondly if what you're saying

1933

01:15:39,410 --> 01:15:37,560

is most of what we think of is the case

1934

01:15:41,330 --> 01:15:39,420

as not so in the same way that we think

1935

01:15:43,310 --> 01:15:41,340

that we model it well then is that not

1936

01:15:45,169 --> 01:15:43,320

trivial to the point of it being useless

1937

01:15:47,870 --> 01:15:45,179

then somewhat of an agreement there

1938

01:15:49,610 --> 01:15:47,880

maybe saying that well look most of the

1939

01:15:50,990 --> 01:15:49,620

world has that illusion and then Bernard

1940

01:15:53,030 --> 01:15:51,000

was like yeah but most of the academics

1941

01:15:55,189 --> 01:15:53,040

that we interact with don't like list me

1942

01:15:57,890 --> 01:15:55,199

one who studies philosophy who thinks in

1943

01:16:01,310 --> 01:15:57,900

the folk Manner and then it became much

1944

01:16:04,149 --> 01:16:01,320

of Bernardo explaining idealism so

1945

01:16:08,810 --> 01:16:07,010

to Susan she did specify more concretely

1946

01:16:10,610 --> 01:16:08,820

what is the illusion that she's talking

1947

01:16:13,370 --> 01:16:10,620

about it has to do with introspective

1948

01:16:15,709 --> 01:16:13,380

Illusions so that's narrow down things

1949

01:16:16,610 --> 01:16:15,719

quite a bit uh when she said that why

1950

01:16:18,410 --> 01:16:16,620

did you not want to use the word

1951

01:16:19,430 --> 01:16:18,420

introspection earlier sue you said it

1952

01:16:21,530 --> 01:16:19,440

was loaded

1953

01:16:23,630 --> 01:16:21,540

oh just because of

1954

01:16:26,750 --> 01:16:23,640

um the way when it happened in the early

1955

01:16:29,510 --> 01:16:26,760

20th century and or late 19th century

1956

01:16:31,610 --> 01:16:29,520

and people got to argue you know they

1957

01:16:33,050 --> 01:16:31,620

had to do these exercises of

1958

01:16:34,550 --> 01:16:33,060

introspecting on when they were looking

1959

01:16:36,290 --> 01:16:34,560

at a certain thing and then they'd argue

1960

01:16:39,530 --> 01:16:36,300

what they found and it became rather

1961

01:16:41,510 --> 01:16:39,540

useless and I suppose brought up in

1962

01:16:44,570 --> 01:16:41,520

Psychology and learning about that the

1963

01:16:47,030 --> 01:16:44,580

word in introspection has a has a bad

1964

01:16:48,770 --> 01:16:47,040

press but perhaps it doesn't that

1965

01:16:50,510 --> 01:16:48,780

doesn't apply to most people who hear

1966

01:16:52,310 --> 01:16:50,520

about introspection

1967

01:16:54,410 --> 01:16:52,320

um I mean all it means is looking within

1968

01:16:56,390 --> 01:16:54,420

now before that happened William James

1969

01:16:58,669 --> 01:16:56,400

was really good on the importance of

1970

01:16:59,930 --> 01:16:58,679

looking within and seeing what we there

1971

01:17:02,810 --> 01:16:59,940

find

1972

01:17:06,470 --> 01:17:02,820

um in his 1890 book for example

1973

01:17:08,450 --> 01:17:06,480

um but but uh behaviorism partly came

1974

01:17:11,149 --> 01:17:08,460

about because of the failure of

1975

01:17:13,370 --> 01:17:11,159

introspectionism and so we were landed

1976

01:17:15,530 --> 01:17:13,380

with a very restrictive behaviorism for

1977

01:17:16,970 --> 01:17:15,540

a long time in Psychology so that was

1978

01:17:19,070 --> 01:17:16,980

why but I don't think it's important

1979

01:17:22,130 --> 01:17:19,080

really I shouldn't have said that

1980

01:17:24,530 --> 01:17:22,140

Skinner's Black Box those were very dark

1981

01:17:27,050 --> 01:17:24,540

times yeah they were yeah like being

1982

01:17:29,570 --> 01:17:27,060

inside the Pacific box yeah

1983

01:17:32,209 --> 01:17:29,580

okay before you both get going the last

1984

01:17:34,250 --> 01:17:32,219

question I had well I guess it's the oh

1985

01:17:36,830 --> 01:17:34,260

second question I had is it's difficult

1986

01:17:38,450 --> 01:17:36,840

to ask Sue this because you don't Place

1987

01:17:40,729 --> 01:17:38,460

yourself in opposition to something

1988

01:17:42,709 --> 01:17:40,739

whereas Bernardo as far as I see from

1989

01:17:44,149 --> 01:17:42,719

you if you're in opposition to something

1990

01:17:47,630 --> 01:17:44,159

it would be materialism so let's just

1991

01:17:50,330 --> 01:17:47,640

take materialism what evidence or events

1992

01:17:52,729 --> 01:17:50,340

can occur that would make you reframe

1993

01:17:55,370 --> 01:17:52,739

your world view to the opposite side so

1994

01:17:57,709 --> 01:17:55,380

materialism like hypothetically what

1995

01:17:59,810 --> 01:17:57,719

could happen What could you see what

1996

01:18:01,490 --> 01:17:59,820

evidence would exist and sued the same

1997

01:18:03,290 --> 01:18:01,500

for you but it's difficult for me to

1998

01:18:05,270 --> 01:18:03,300

place yourself in opposition to say you

1999

01:18:06,770 --> 01:18:05,280

move to the other side so I don't know

2000

01:18:09,110 --> 01:18:06,780

well I can give you a different other

2001

01:18:11,990 --> 01:18:09,120

side YouTube because this comes up a lot

2002

01:18:15,950 --> 01:18:12,000

in my life if there were convincing

2003

01:18:18,770 --> 01:18:15,960

evidence of telepathy or of

2004

01:18:21,709 --> 01:18:18,780

um well let's stick stick with telepathy

2005

01:18:23,630 --> 01:18:21,719

um that was done with experiments with

2006

01:18:26,090 --> 01:18:23,640

adequate design and the statistics

2007

01:18:29,330 --> 01:18:26,100

properly done and with enough subjects

2008

01:18:31,810 --> 01:18:29,340

and so on so on uh and I became

2009

01:18:35,330 --> 01:18:31,820

convinced that telepathy was possible

2010

01:18:37,669 --> 01:18:35,340

then most of what I've thought about is

2011

01:18:39,590 --> 01:18:37,679

wrong in fact most of science is wrong

2012

01:18:41,750 --> 01:18:39,600

and you know the world changes

2013

01:18:43,729 --> 01:18:41,760

dramatically if that were the case but

2014

01:18:45,229 --> 01:18:43,739

but you're an automatic realist you said

2015

01:18:48,830 --> 01:18:45,239

it in the beginning

2016

01:18:51,770 --> 01:18:48,840

no no no I I it's not about materialism

2017

01:18:53,689 --> 01:18:51,780

it's about the way minds work

2018

01:18:55,550 --> 01:18:53,699

um because if there were telepathy then

2019

01:18:57,110 --> 01:18:55,560

most of the psychology experiments that

2020

01:18:58,910 --> 01:18:57,120

we do wouldn't work because you have to

2021

01:19:00,470 --> 01:18:58,920

have you know control conditions in

2022

01:19:02,390 --> 01:19:00,480

which people don't know what's going on

2023

01:19:04,130 --> 01:19:02,400

and then things like the placebo effect

2024

01:19:05,930 --> 01:19:04,140

would be completely

2025

01:19:07,669 --> 01:19:05,940

um changed because you could never

2026

01:19:09,770 --> 01:19:07,679

really be sure what people knew or

2027

01:19:11,870 --> 01:19:09,780

didn't know because they'd know they'd

2028

01:19:13,250 --> 01:19:11,880

know more than you think they know if

2029

01:19:14,830 --> 01:19:13,260

there was telepathy was possible it

2030

01:19:17,570 --> 01:19:14,840

would just ruin a whole lot of stuff

2031

01:19:19,790 --> 01:19:17,580

whether you're a materialist or not it

2032

01:19:21,890 --> 01:19:19,800

would have a dramatic effect on my

2033

01:19:24,110 --> 01:19:21,900

thinking about the nature of mind

2034

01:19:26,990 --> 01:19:24,120

couldn't it just increase the error bar

2035

01:19:28,250 --> 01:19:27,000

and not invalidate everything

2036

01:19:31,850 --> 01:19:28,260

uh

2037

01:19:33,590 --> 01:19:31,860

to Think Through that's a that's a

2038

01:19:35,330 --> 01:19:33,600

perfectly reasonable question

2039

01:19:36,709 --> 01:19:35,340

um I think it the error bars will be so

2040

01:19:38,330 --> 01:19:36,719

huge that a whole lot of things would

2041

01:19:39,649 --> 01:19:38,340

just collapse

2042

01:19:41,870 --> 01:19:39,659

um but

2043

01:19:44,630 --> 01:19:41,880

I don't know I'm more optimistic than

2044

01:19:47,330 --> 01:19:44,640

you in this regard yeah you think you

2045

01:19:49,310 --> 01:19:47,340

think it might happen I I think no

2046

01:19:51,350 --> 01:19:49,320

process in nature is perfect

2047

01:19:54,229 --> 01:19:51,360

when it stops raining the ground doesn't

2048

01:19:55,850 --> 01:19:54,239

dry immediately when something Burns it

2049

01:19:57,950 --> 01:19:55,860

doesn't consume everything there is to

2050

01:20:00,050 --> 01:19:57,960

be combusted no processing nature is

2051
01:20:02,990 --> 01:20:00,060
perfect dissociation wouldn't be perfect

2052
01:20:04,430 --> 01:20:03,000
either especially under laboratory

2053
01:20:06,169 --> 01:20:04,440
conditions when you don't have that

2054
01:20:08,450 --> 01:20:06,179
emotional charge of real life

2055
01:20:10,610 --> 01:20:08,460
circumstances uh

2056
01:20:12,590 --> 01:20:10,620
um then you would be highly dissociated

2057
01:20:13,850 --> 01:20:12,600
but under normal circumstances there

2058
01:20:16,729 --> 01:20:13,860
could be

2059
01:20:18,950 --> 01:20:16,739
you know occasions in which the

2060
01:20:20,630 --> 01:20:18,960
dissociation becomes porous and I'm

2061
01:20:22,430 --> 01:20:20,640
saying this to you because I witnessed

2062
01:20:23,810 --> 01:20:22,440
one of these cases that I just cannot

2063
01:20:25,010 --> 01:20:23,820

dismiss

2064

01:20:28,250 --> 01:20:25,020

um but I don't think it would even

2065

01:20:32,090 --> 01:20:28,260

validate science because even if it can

2066

01:20:35,810 --> 01:20:32,100

happen it happens so rarely now and now

2067

01:20:38,090 --> 01:20:35,820

it's not even rare but the strength the

2068

01:20:41,689 --> 01:20:38,100

degree of the effect

2069

01:20:43,310 --> 01:20:41,699

is so tiny that's statistically speaking

2070

01:20:45,649 --> 01:20:43,320

I don't think it would invalidate

2071

01:20:47,510 --> 01:20:45,659

anything obviously we can't read each

2072

01:20:49,430 --> 01:20:47,520

other's minds all the time

2073

01:20:51,050 --> 01:20:49,440

obviously we don't know what's going on

2074

01:20:54,050 --> 01:20:51,060

in China all the time

2075

01:20:56,990 --> 01:20:54,060

right so even if there is some porosity

2076
01:20:58,610 --> 01:20:57,000
under emotionally charged circumstances

2077
01:21:00,649 --> 01:20:58,620
of normal life

2078
01:21:02,630 --> 01:21:00,659
they wouldn't apply on their laboratory

2079
01:21:04,850 --> 01:21:02,640
conditions anyway and that's why we

2080
01:21:07,430 --> 01:21:04,860
don't see it under laboratory conditions

2081
01:21:10,070 --> 01:21:07,440
so I wouldn't be worried at least

2082
01:21:11,689 --> 01:21:10,080
personally I'm not worried and I saw one

2083
01:21:13,250 --> 01:21:11,699
no I'm not saying I'm worried it would

2084
01:21:14,630 --> 01:21:13,260
be terribly exciting and I've said so

2085
01:21:16,490 --> 01:21:14,640
many times I would go back into

2086
01:21:18,350 --> 01:21:16,500
parapsychology if that happened I mean

2087
01:21:20,630 --> 01:21:18,360
the fact is there is no viable Theory

2088
01:21:24,110 --> 01:21:20,640

within parapsychology of how this could

2089

01:21:26,270 --> 01:21:24,120

work and if there were evidence that it

2090

01:21:28,130 --> 01:21:26,280

did work you could start to do

2091

01:21:30,890 --> 01:21:28,140

experimental work to test theories but

2092

01:21:32,570 --> 01:21:30,900

that just hasn't happened so that's what

2093

01:21:34,610 --> 01:21:32,580

makes me kind of well it's not

2094

01:21:36,890 --> 01:21:34,620

pessimistic pessimistic about the

2095

01:21:39,290 --> 01:21:36,900

possibility of being found

2096

01:21:42,350 --> 01:21:39,300

um but I don't think it's going to

2097

01:21:43,970 --> 01:21:42,360

happen but we shall see and if it did I

2098

01:21:45,470 --> 01:21:43,980

still maintain it would have dramatic

2099

01:21:48,610 --> 01:21:45,480

effects on our understanding of all

2100

01:21:53,390 --> 01:21:51,050

another idealism it would be nothing

2101
01:21:56,149 --> 01:21:53,400
extraordinary yes the dissociative

2102
01:21:58,130 --> 01:21:56,159
boundary yeah what did you witness

2103
01:22:00,649 --> 01:21:58,140
Bernardo what did you witness and was

2104
01:22:03,610 --> 01:22:00,659
one of those I was in a

2105
01:22:06,350 --> 01:22:03,620
sure no no it was not understand

2106
01:22:08,030 --> 01:22:06,360
I was on a on a holiday with my

2107
01:22:10,669 --> 01:22:08,040
girlfriend we were sort of out of

2108
01:22:13,729 --> 01:22:10,679
civilization for one week you know in

2109
01:22:15,649 --> 01:22:13,739
Germany she's from Germany and um and we

2110
01:22:17,450 --> 01:22:15,659
were already out of contact with family

2111
01:22:18,830 --> 01:22:17,460
and friends for one week one day she

2112
01:22:21,530 --> 01:22:18,840
wakes up in the morning I was already

2113
01:22:24,050 --> 01:22:21,540

awake when she woke up and she says I

2114

01:22:26,450 --> 01:22:24,060

had a strange dream I saw my grandmother

2115

01:22:29,870 --> 01:22:26,460

with her head wrapped up in in gauze

2116

01:22:32,750 --> 01:22:29,880

case gauze in a hospital with her two

2117

01:22:34,550 --> 01:22:32,760

daughters on on her side nothing was

2118

01:22:36,110 --> 01:22:34,560

moving nothing was happening but they

2119

01:22:37,189 --> 01:22:36,120

could pick up from her thoughts that she

2120

01:22:39,350 --> 01:22:37,199

was okay

2121

01:22:41,450 --> 01:22:39,360

and then I was playing with interpreting

2122

01:22:43,430 --> 01:22:41,460

her dreams from a union perspective for

2123

01:22:45,410 --> 01:22:43,440

a while we were playing that game and

2124

01:22:48,470 --> 01:22:45,420

when she told me that I thought this

2125

01:22:50,149 --> 01:22:48,480

this is highly unusual and something

2126

01:22:53,149 --> 01:22:50,159

came into me and I said call your father

2127

01:22:55,189 --> 01:22:53,159

so she called her father and her

2128

01:22:57,110 --> 01:22:55,199

grandmother had three children two women

2129

01:23:01,430 --> 01:22:57,120

and her father

2130

01:23:03,830 --> 01:23:01,440

phone and said well good that you're

2131

01:23:06,050 --> 01:23:03,840

calling because in the middle of the

2132

01:23:09,110 --> 01:23:06,060

night no two or three hours ago before

2133

01:23:11,590 --> 01:23:09,120

she had woken up her grandmother had had

2134

01:23:14,630 --> 01:23:11,600

a brain stroke and was in the hospital

2135

01:23:16,910 --> 01:23:14,640

with her two daughters but the doctor

2136

01:23:18,830 --> 01:23:16,920

said although she couldn't speak yet the

2137

01:23:21,350 --> 01:23:18,840

doctor said she's not on their life on

2138

01:23:23,750 --> 01:23:21,360

the risk of life anymore and I thought

2139

01:23:28,130 --> 01:23:23,760

this is unprompted

2140

01:23:30,890 --> 01:23:28,140

so bloody specific that I thought okay

2141

01:23:32,750 --> 01:23:30,900

this [h__h] happens it's all right I can

2142

01:23:35,870 --> 01:23:32,760

live with it and I'm not abandoning

2143

01:23:40,070 --> 01:23:38,149

oh dear well I won't go through all my

2144

01:23:44,090 --> 01:23:40,080

usual reasons why those things happen

2145

01:23:45,770 --> 01:23:44,100

and how never mind now I know you got to

2146

01:23:47,390 --> 01:23:45,780

get going Sue but briefly I didn't get

2147

01:23:49,189 --> 01:23:47,400

bernardo's answer to that question of

2148

01:23:50,990 --> 01:23:49,199

what would cause him to reconsider or

2149

01:23:52,370 --> 01:23:51,000

not reconsider but actually move and

2150

01:23:53,750 --> 01:23:52,380

we're going to get to that but you

2151
01:23:55,010 --> 01:23:53,760
mentioned that you didn't see any

2152
01:23:57,050 --> 01:23:55,020
evidence and you know that there's

2153
01:23:58,990 --> 01:23:57,060
parapsychologists like Dean Rayden and

2154
01:24:02,090 --> 01:23:59,000
Julia

2155
01:24:04,130 --> 01:24:02,100
right and Daryl bem and I believe

2156
01:24:05,450 --> 01:24:04,140
Jeffrey mishlov is a cataloger rather

2157
01:24:07,610 --> 01:24:05,460
than a researcher but I could be

2158
01:24:09,530 --> 01:24:07,620
mistaken about that and Rupert sheldrake

2159
01:24:11,810 --> 01:24:09,540
so what do you make of their research

2160
01:24:14,870 --> 01:24:11,820
please uh this has to be for another

2161
01:24:18,350 --> 01:24:14,880
time uh it's there's so much to say and

2162
01:24:20,209 --> 01:24:18,360
I I'm tired now and I I really don't

2163
01:24:22,189 --> 01:24:20,219

want to have to do that fairly would be

2164

01:24:23,990 --> 01:24:22,199

very complex and it would involve a lot

2165

01:24:25,970 --> 01:24:24,000

of devious things that have gone on and

2166

01:24:28,310 --> 01:24:25,980

things I've discovered along the way and

2167

01:24:29,689 --> 01:24:28,320

it's another story okay but the point is

2168

01:24:31,729 --> 01:24:29,699

you've gone through their research and

2169

01:24:34,370 --> 01:24:31,739

it's not that you haven't seen them oh

2170

01:24:36,649 --> 01:24:34,380

God yes a lot not recently because I

2171

01:24:38,750 --> 01:24:36,659

gave up I really gave up doing

2172

01:24:40,790 --> 01:24:38,760

parapsychology around the turn of the

2173

01:24:42,770 --> 01:24:40,800

century and up until that time I would

2174

01:24:45,590 --> 01:24:42,780

have said that I was pretty much an

2175

01:24:46,729 --> 01:24:45,600

expert on the the literature that I you

2176

01:24:48,890 --> 01:24:46,739

know because I was really kept up with

2177

01:24:50,510 --> 01:24:48,900

it all since then I haven't so there may

2178

01:24:52,970 --> 01:24:50,520

have been things that have happened I

2179

01:24:54,590 --> 01:24:52,980

know vaguely about but to really examine

2180

01:24:56,810 --> 01:24:54,600

somebody's work and find out what was

2181

01:24:58,490 --> 01:24:56,820

going on takes a lot of effort arguably

2182

01:25:00,470 --> 01:24:58,500

it can take more time and effort than

2183

01:25:02,450 --> 01:25:00,480

doing the original research and I've

2184

01:25:04,310 --> 01:25:02,460

done a lot of that

2185

01:25:09,410 --> 01:25:04,320

um but it's a long story

2186

01:25:16,130 --> 01:25:13,070

you're asking me to hypothesize about

2187

01:25:18,350 --> 01:25:16,140

evidence that would convince me of an

2188

01:25:20,930 --> 01:25:18,360

unnecessary and problematic hypothesis

2189

01:25:22,550 --> 01:25:20,940

so this is how I hear it so you

2190

01:25:24,709 --> 01:25:22,560

understand how I experience the question

2191

01:25:26,930 --> 01:25:24,719

it's like somebody who is telling me the

2192

01:25:28,490 --> 01:25:26,940

Flying Spaghetti Monster exists and it

2193

01:25:30,470 --> 01:25:28,500

it's the thing responsible for making

2194

01:25:33,229 --> 01:25:30,480

the planets go around their orbits with

2195

01:25:35,510 --> 01:25:33,239

its invisible noodly appendages reaching

2196

01:25:38,410 --> 01:25:35,520

out from a higher Dimension so Bernardo

2197

01:25:41,450 --> 01:25:38,420

what evidence would you need

2198

01:25:43,310 --> 01:25:41,460

to to or I would ask this person what

2199

01:25:45,169 --> 01:25:43,320

evidence do you need to discard the

2200

01:25:48,590 --> 01:25:45,179

Flying Spaghetti Monster hypothesis it's

2201

01:25:52,450 --> 01:25:48,600

like you know what do you have to come

2202

01:25:54,590 --> 01:25:52,460

up with materialism is explanatory

2203

01:25:56,149 --> 01:25:54,600

dissatisfying doesn't explain experience

2204

01:25:58,310 --> 01:25:56,159

in other words there is a sense in which

2205

01:26:00,050 --> 01:25:58,320

you explain it explains nothing because

2206

01:26:03,050 --> 01:26:00,060

all of our knowledge is conveyed by

2207

01:26:05,689 --> 01:26:03,060

experience materialism is internally

2208

01:26:07,910 --> 01:26:05,699

contradictory it replaces descriptions

2209

01:26:10,010 --> 01:26:07,920

for the thing described and then tries

2210

01:26:12,169 --> 01:26:10,020

to recover the thing described from the

2211

01:26:14,030 --> 01:26:12,179

descriptions I mean it's like a dog

2212

01:26:17,270 --> 01:26:14,040

chasing its own tail at light speed and

2213

01:26:19,610 --> 01:26:17,280

hoping to catch it one day it is um

2214

01:26:21,590 --> 01:26:19,620

empirically inadequate and Nobel Prize

2215

01:26:23,390 --> 01:26:21,600

last year went to experiments that show

2216

01:26:26,090 --> 01:26:23,400

that physical entities do not have

2217

01:26:28,129 --> 01:26:26,100

Standalone existence unless you believe

2218

01:26:29,990 --> 01:26:28,139

in some science fiction stuff like

2219

01:26:32,330 --> 01:26:30,000

parallel universes popping out every

2220

01:26:34,310 --> 01:26:32,340

fraction of a second for no reason or if

2221

01:26:36,169 --> 01:26:34,320

you believe in the magical hidden

2222

01:26:38,149 --> 01:26:36,179

variables of super determinism that are

2223

01:26:39,590 --> 01:26:38,159

not even described enough for us to be

2224

01:26:41,629 --> 01:26:39,600

able to say what they they are supposed

2225

01:26:43,610 --> 01:26:41,639

to be they are defined in terms of what

2226

01:26:46,729 --> 01:26:43,620

they need to do for us to rescue

2227

01:26:49,610 --> 01:26:46,739

materialism from that so it's so

2228

01:26:51,950 --> 01:26:49,620

overwhelming the K is against it is so

2229

01:26:54,890 --> 01:26:51,960

overwhelming that if you and I know it's

2230

01:26:56,750 --> 01:26:54,900

a dissatisfactory answer but if you ask

2231

01:26:58,790 --> 01:26:56,760

me what would make you change your mind

2232

01:27:01,970 --> 01:26:58,800

it's like well I would need to be a

2233

01:27:04,129 --> 01:27:01,980

child again that's what it would take I

2234

01:27:07,250 --> 01:27:04,139

would need to not have the knowledge and

2235

01:27:10,490 --> 01:27:07,260

the understanding that I have today uh

2236

01:27:11,750 --> 01:27:10,500

because it's a purial hypo vertices and

2237

01:27:13,790 --> 01:27:11,760

it was from the beginning the difference

2238

01:27:16,070 --> 01:27:13,800

is that people knew in the beginning it

2239

01:27:19,010 --> 01:27:16,080

was a pure Royal hypothesis and they did

2240

01:27:20,930 --> 01:27:19,020

it anyway because it was a a weapon

2241

01:27:22,610 --> 01:27:20,940

against the church by the way the needy

2242

01:27:24,410 --> 01:27:22,620

the horizontal record one of the authors

2243

01:27:26,390 --> 01:27:24,420

of lion cyclopedia the founding document

2244

01:27:28,550 --> 01:27:26,400

of the Enlightenment his own record

2245

01:27:30,350 --> 01:27:28,560

saying materialism doesn't work but we

2246

01:27:32,629 --> 01:27:30,360

need to keep on using it as a weapon

2247

01:27:36,290 --> 01:27:32,639

against the church but at some point mid

2248

01:27:39,110 --> 01:27:36,300

19th century because of the you know the

2249

01:27:41,870 --> 01:27:39,120

the Bourgeois Revolution led by Darwin

2250

01:27:43,490 --> 01:27:41,880

and others we forgot that because we

2251

01:27:45,770 --> 01:27:43,500

wanted the intellectual Elite to have

2252

01:27:49,430 --> 01:27:45,780

not not only to survive the church but

2253

01:27:52,189 --> 01:27:49,440

to have a domain over the church as far

2254

01:27:54,770 --> 01:27:52,199

as the culture is concerned and then it

2255

01:27:56,510 --> 01:27:54,780

went sideways but to me it's like I

2256

01:27:58,850 --> 01:27:56,520

can't answer this question I would have

2257

01:28:02,510 --> 01:27:58,860

to unlearn what I have learned over 48

2258

01:28:04,310 --> 01:28:02,520

years to to tell you something it's a

2259

01:28:07,790 --> 01:28:04,320

more formed hypothesis it's not even

2260

01:28:10,370 --> 01:28:07,800

wrong it's inconsistent it it's a

2261

01:28:12,470 --> 01:28:10,380

catastrophe so we if you ask me what

2262

01:28:15,649 --> 01:28:12,480

make what would change my mind

2263

01:28:18,470 --> 01:28:15,659

about the Multiverse hypothesis that I

2264

01:28:20,990 --> 01:28:18,480

could tell you I could tell you about if

2265

01:28:23,270 --> 01:28:21,000

we had an event with Statistics behind

2266

01:28:25,610 --> 01:28:23,280

it at CERN

2267

01:28:28,610 --> 01:28:25,620

um in which the energy footprint exceeds

2268

01:28:29,990 --> 01:28:28,620

what we can account for under a Quantum

2269

01:28:32,390 --> 01:28:30,000

field Theory

2270

01:28:34,189 --> 01:28:32,400

then I would say okay there is a leakage

2271

01:28:36,290 --> 01:28:34,199

across dimensions and I would take that

2272

01:28:38,090 --> 01:28:36,300

hypothesis more seriously but if you ask

2273

01:28:40,729 --> 01:28:38,100

me what would make me take materialism

2274

01:28:42,830 --> 01:28:40,739

seriously it's like asking me what would

2275

01:28:45,290 --> 01:28:42,840

what would it take for me to take the

2276

01:28:46,669 --> 01:28:45,300

Flying Spaghetti Monster seriously I

2277

01:28:48,830 --> 01:28:46,679

don't know the Flying Spaghetti Monster

2278

01:28:52,070 --> 01:28:48,840

would have to show up in front of me

2279

01:28:53,930 --> 01:28:52,080

no oh I haven't on Heaven and Hell

2280

01:28:55,010 --> 01:28:53,940

what what could convince me that the

2281

01:28:57,770 --> 01:28:55,020

seven or Hell well near-death

2282

01:28:59,450 --> 01:28:57,780

experiences certainly won't yeah so yeah

2283

01:29:01,370 --> 01:28:59,460

sorry sorry it's a dissatisfying the

2284

01:29:04,310 --> 01:29:01,380

answer

2285

01:29:06,530 --> 01:29:04,320

all right thank you all thank you all so

2286

01:29:08,149 --> 01:29:06,540

much and thank you for coming on thank

2287

01:29:09,890 --> 01:29:08,159

you for coming on for your seventh or

2288

01:29:13,129 --> 01:29:09,900

eighth time Bernardo and thank you for

2289

01:29:14,090 --> 01:29:13,139

your premiere on toll Susan and

2290

01:29:16,510 --> 01:29:14,100

hopefully it's not your last time

2291

01:29:18,709 --> 01:29:16,520

hopefully we do a one-on-one as well

2292

01:29:21,530 --> 01:29:18,719

it's been a pleasure

2293

01:29:23,149 --> 01:29:21,540

thank you the podcast is now concluded

2294

01:29:24,709 --> 01:29:23,159

thank you for watching if you haven't

2295

01:29:26,510 --> 01:29:24,719

subscribed or clicked on that like

2296

01:29:29,689 --> 01:29:26,520

button now would be a great time to do

2297

01:29:31,490 --> 01:29:29,699

so as each subscribe and like helps

2298

01:29:33,350 --> 01:29:31,500

YouTube push this content to more people

2299

01:29:35,750 --> 01:29:33,360

you should also know that there's a

2300

01:29:37,310 --> 01:29:35,760

remarkably active Discord and subreddit

2301
01:29:39,590 --> 01:29:37,320
for theories of everything where people

2302
01:29:41,870 --> 01:29:39,600
explicate tolls disagree respectfully

2303
01:29:44,629 --> 01:29:41,880
about theories and build as a community

2304
01:29:46,550 --> 01:29:44,639
our own toes links to both are in the

2305
01:29:48,830 --> 01:29:46,560
description also I recently found out

2306
01:29:50,990 --> 01:29:48,840
that external links count plenty toward

2307
01:29:53,810 --> 01:29:51,000
the algorithm which means that when you

2308
01:29:55,970 --> 01:29:53,820
share on Twitter on Facebook on Reddit

2309
01:29:57,830 --> 01:29:55,980
Etc it shows YouTube that people are

2310
01:29:59,930 --> 01:29:57,840
talking about this outside of YouTube

2311
01:30:01,729 --> 01:29:59,940
which in turn greatly AIDS the

2312
01:30:03,410 --> 01:30:01,739
Distribution on YouTube as well if you'd

2313
01:30:05,709 --> 01:30:03,420

like to support more conversations like

2314

01:30:07,790 --> 01:30:05,719

this then do consider visiting

2315

01:30:10,070 --> 01:30:07,800

theoriesofeverything.org again it's

2316

01:30:12,470 --> 01:30:10,080

support from the sponsors and you that

2317

01:30:14,090 --> 01:30:12,480

allow me to work on toe full time you

2318

01:30:16,189 --> 01:30:14,100

get early access to ad-free audio

2319

01:30:18,290 --> 01:30:16,199

episodes there as well every dollar

2320

01:30:20,149 --> 01:30:18,300

helps far more than you may think either